

**Using Artistic Expression as A Teaching Strategy for Social Justice:
Examining Music from the Civil Rights and BlackLivesMatter Movements**

Jeremy W. Bohonos

Bohonos2@illinois.edu

Kimberly D. Otchere

kimhodge@illinois.edu

Yoon Pak

yoopak@illinois.edu

College of Education

University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, USA

Copyright © 2018 Jeremy W. Bohonos, Kimberly D. Otchere, and Yoon Pak

Abstract

Problem: Members of organizations often struggle to grasp the importance of social movements and to understand the affective dimensions of the injustices that inspire them.

Solution: We argued that combining artistic expression with Social Movement Learning (SML) in HRD can help members of the dominant culture to better empathize with those who experiences marginalization. This will help organizations to better relate to social movements, and to more effectively address related injustices.

Key Stakeholders: HRD scholars and practitioners as well as those engaged in social movements.

Keywords: Social Movement Learning, Social Justice HRD, Black Lives Matter, Civil Rights Movement

Introduction

The music of the movement is the language of liberation. This language must be intentionally and methodically taught from generation to generation. A civil rights movement without the music loses its "Africanness" and takes on an "iceman" characteristic.

- Rev. Otis Moss, Jr. From the introduction to the African American Heritage Hymnal

The purpose of this article is to highlight how art education and social movement learning can be incorporated into HRD to enhance social justice education. This approach uses the power of music and artistic expression to highlight historical narratives of oppression. We argue that the formation of social justice education in HRD must center the range of human experiences into its organizational structures and practices. Throughout American history, social movements have been key drivers of social and political change, and should, therefore, be considered indispensable components of efforts in pursuit of social justice (Bonilla-Silva, 2014). However, students often struggle to understand the social justice missions of social movements leading to mottled understandings of social movements' goals and stratagems. By positioning social movements within a critical human resource development (CHRD) paradigm, this article seeks to facilitate deeper examination of the historical legacies and unjust acts that have ignited organizing efforts around the Civil Rights (CRM) and the Black Lives Matter (BLM) movements.

The Significance and Need for Social Justice Education

This article combines a social justice pedagogy framework and artistic expression, a relatively new instructional method in the field of HRD, to assist learners to engage in social movement learning. In this effort, we emphasize the study of songs that emerged from social movements as vehicles to deepen learners' connections to the affective dimensions of racial injustice. It is crucial for learners to develop felt connections to social injustice if they are to transform their ways of thinking and knowing and apply this transformation in efforts to create more socially just organizations. In this article, we advocate for educators to develop curricula that apply musically inspired social movement learning to issues related to organizational social justice. Research on social justice education in HRD (Bohonos, Otchere & Pak,

Bohonos, J. W., Otchere, K. D., & Pak, y. (2019). Artistic expression as a teaching strategy for social movements: deepening understandings of the civil rights and #blacklivesmatter movements. *Advances in developing human resources*, 21(2), 250-266. Doi.org/10.1177/1523422319827942 4

2018) suggests that graduate students hunger for a deeper level of instructional content directed towards organizational social justice, a term coined by Byrd (2012). Organizational social justice is an ideology that envisions an equal balance of human rights and justice outcomes for all members of an organization regardless of their socially constructed identity. In addition, Bohonos et al. point to disconnects between faculty and students' interpretations of how social justice should be taught. On the one hand, faculty frequently note being hesitant to teach specific forms of social injustice for reasons such as limitations placed on them by their institutions, their own lack of interest in the topic, fear of being on the wrong side of an issue, or concerns about tokenizing minoritized groups. Students, on the other hand, express a desire for more specific teaching related to social injustice.

Social movement learning (SML) happens when individuals learn as a result of their involvement with social movements (Duguid, Mündel, & Schugurensky, 2007). Envisioning the field of HRD as a community of scholars and practitioners who are concerned for more socially just organizations is consistent with the idea that "social movements are epistemological communities" (Scandrett, Crowther, Hemmi, Mukherjee, Shah, & Sen, 2010, p. 124) and supports Grenier's acknowledgment in the Preface that such communities will "take part in the creation and dissemination of knowledge, theory and culture through both 'cognitive praxis' and the establishment of spaces of social learning" (p. xx).

Grenier further notes in the Preface that organizations often struggle to understand how to best relate to the social movements that surround them, and that HRD practitioners often do not know how to respond to social movements in relation to their work. A significant goal of this article is to address how HRD researchers, scholars, and particularly educators can apply SML to gain insight, participate in, and learn from social movements. To do this we first present an overview of critical HRD and social justice approaches to HRD, which are foundational to HRD professionals teaching about and learning from social movements. We then provide a critical examination of artistic expression in the form of music that emerged during CRM and BLM as a means of teaching social justice

Linking Social Movement Learning to Social Justice Perspectives in HRD

A growing number of HRD authors argue that limited research exists on critical and social justice approaches to HRD. Bierema and Callahan (2014) defined CHRD as “the process of engaging human and organizational systems that relate, learn, change, and organize in ways that optimize human interest, organization advancement, and social impact” (p. 436). In a refocusing of McLean and McLean’s (2001) definition of HRD, Bohonos (2016) directed CHRD towards a more social justice perspective and defined Social Justice HRD (SJHRD) as:

Any process or activity that, either initially or over the long term, has the potential to ally with disempowered individuals or groups to develop adults’ work-based knowledge, expertise, productivity, and satisfaction whether for under-represented or culturally marginalized groups, nations laboring under the yoke of colonial or post-colonial burdens, peoples displaced or disinherited by war or political intrigue, and ultimately the whole of humanity. (p. 14)

Byrd (2018a) further addressed social justice in HRD by emphasizing a social justice paradigm that:

(1) shifts conversations to the affective nature of actions that are unjust and uncivil; (2) represents transformation (from the mindset of privilege) and emancipation (from the mindset of the marginalized); and (3) brings a humanitarian principle to the field of HRD where concern for the welfare, dignity, and respect for all people aligns with the concern for learning, growth, and development. (p. 8)

The educational goals of critical and social justice HRD often align with the change goals of social movements, which creates the potential for SML to be a shared space where HRD interacts with social movements. Byrd’s (2018a) framework for social justice in HRD is particularly salient for seeking synergies between HRD and social movements. Her suggestion that we shift conversations toward social and organizational injustice is in keeping with the ethos of many social movements, such as the CRM and

Bohonos, J. W., Otchere, K. D., & Pak, y. (2019). Artistic expression as a teaching strategy for social movements: deepening understandings of the civil rights and #blacklivesmatter movements. *Advances in developing human resources*, 21(2), 250-266. Doi.org/10.1177/1523422319827942 6

BLM, that seek to start conversations about injustice that can lead to meaningful actions for justice.

Using artistic expression to demonstrate the affective consequences of social injustice, is intended to assist learners in developing greater empathy for marginalized groups in a way that facilitates transformation and personal growth. Furthermore, artistic expression has the power to bring about transformation (of the oppressor) and emancipation (of the oppressed),

Critical Analysis of Selected Social Justice Movements in the United States

The Civil Rights Movement and the Black Lives Matter Movement are salient starting points for historical examinations of systemic racial injustice, including regressions in post-Civil War Reconstruction Era Amendments promising enfranchisement and citizenship rights (such as the 13th, 14th, and 15th Amendments) for African Americans. These inter-relational topics weave in how and where Black Lives Matter took place. HRD-related articles on resistance to diversity (Bierema, 2010c), development of progressive theoretical strains such as critical theory (Gedro, Collins, & Rocco, 2014), and critical race theory (Rocco, Bernier, & Bowman, 2014), as well as inclusion efforts (Bierema, 2010b; Bierema & Callahan, 2014; Gedro, & Mizzi, 2014; Pleasant, 2017), can be placed alongside foundational disciplinary readings related to racial and gendered formations (Butler, 2006; Crenshaw, 1989; Lopez, 1997; Omi & Winant, 2015) in conversation with critical race theory (Bell, 1992) and notions of privilege in HRD (Harris, 1993; Rocco & Gallagher, 2006). Elements of social movement learning stem from the idea that how we think about social movements in the 21st century might have had different orientations in the 18th, 19th, and 20th centuries but yet are inextricably linked by the prevalence of racism and sexism under different guises; and that organizational structures and practices are reflective of these traditions.

The academic literature featuring BLM frequently draws comparisons and delineates distinctions relative to the CRM (Clayton, 2018; Jones-Eversley, Adedoyin, Robinson & More, 2017; Chernega, 2016). Both movements are understood to be rooted in to inequities experienced by African Americans including inadequate access to opportunities such as education, housing, political representation,

employment, healthcare, and fair treatment under the law. Unequal access combined with reactions against pervasive stereotyping and violence against people of color energized both the CRM and BLM.

The Civil Rights Movement

In opposition to white supremacists' efforts to deny and limit the rights of African Americans through the use of Black Codes, Jim Crow laws, and insistence on maintaining separate and unequal institutions for Blacks (which were argued to be separate but equal), the modern Civil Rights Movement began in the 1950s. It should be noted, however, that the civil rights movement for enfranchisement should not be confined to a particular time period but that it had always existed in the U.S. from the 17th century. The 20th century movement coalesced under the leadership of Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. who pursued equal protection under the law through non-violent protest and by challenging stereotypes of Black inferiority (Clayton, 2018; Jones-Eversley et al., 2017; Chernega, 2016). One key tactic used by CRM leadership was to stage peaceful protests, resulting in excessive and violent responses from White law enforcement and counter-protesters. The growth of television news made this approach particularly useful as images of violence against African American's were broadcast into the homes of Whites who were thereby forced to confront the reality of racial inequity in their nation (Garrow, 1987). International broadcast of this footage also embarrassed many Americans by revealing to the world the hypocrisy between stated American democratic ideals of individual freedom and the realities of racial apartheid.

The CRM helped launch revisions in legislation intended to guarantee equal protection under the law and cease legalized segregation. The CRM worked closely with Black churches to organize protests, and its leadership tended to mirror the patriarchy and gender conservatism commonly found in Christian churches' formal leadership (Clayton, 2018; Jones-Eversley et al., 2017; Chernega, 2016). BLM continues the racial justice work started in the CRM, but works to do so in ways that inclusive of women and members of the LGBTQ community.

The Black Lives Matter Movement

The BLM movement emerged to confront the New Jim Crow (Alexander, 2010; Brewer & Heitzbg, 2008) which includes inequities in the criminal justice system leading to mass incarceration, racialized violence, and other contemporary forms of discrimination enacted against of People of Color (POC). The movement grew in response to the murders of unarmed African Americans by white police officers or white vigilante citizens. One of the primary differences between BLM and CRM is that the former coalesced around the leadership of queer women of color and works to actively challenge patriarchy and heterosexism in the struggle for racial equity (Garza, 2014). Like CRM, BLM activists engage in musical and other forms of creative expression to educate and raise consciousness regarding systemic inequity (Chernega, 2016; Clayton, 2018; Jones-Eversley et al., 2017).

A Framework for Teaching Social Justice

The Social Justice Critical Reflection Model (SJCRCM) (Ingram & Walters, 2007) was created for teaching social justice. This method operates on multiple levels that include descriptive thinking, dialogical thinking, critical reflection, critical consciousness, and praxis. Descriptive thinking is a literal or surface level understanding of texts or events; dialogical thinking includes making inferences regarding biases and stereotypes while engaging in dialogue. Critical reflection considers historical, political and social contexts to better understand the connections between power, privilege, policy, and culture. Critical consciousness proceeds from problematizing one's attitudes and social position, and from working to understand the cultural orientation of others. Finally, praxis is the application of theory in a way that facilitates social transformation. The five schemata of the SJCRCM do not proceed from one to the other in linear fashion, but exist in a dynamic relationship with one another. The goal of an educator using this model is to facilitate learner engagement in all of the identified areas in an effort to encourage social justice action, which can include participation in social movements.

Ingram and Walters (2007) initially used the SJCRCM in conjunction with the study of poetry and literature as vehicles to challenge the privileged positions of scientific truth claims while discussing the

affective dimensions of various forms of social injustice. Social injustice affects people in a variety of ways and teaching for social justice should include discussions of equitable redistribution of resources (Bell, 2007; Hanley, 2014), representations of the cultures and identities of marginalized peoples (Hanley, 2014; North, 2006), and discussions pertaining to the affective dimensions of marginalization (Byrd, 2018a). HRD approaches to these topics have the potential to radically alter organizational thinking around what constitutes equitable redistribution of resources and inclusive representation, for example. We assert that such necessary praxis will require considerable and prolonged commitment.

Artistic Expression as a Strategy for Teaching Social Justice

Artistic expression refers to a passionate engagement with one's artistic self, generally stimulated by an emotional event with the hopes of transmitting that emotion to others. The highly emotionally charged events of CRM captured the attention of 20th century performance artists who became advocates through various forms of artistic expression. Artists who personally identified with events that developed from the CRM added another layer of expression and interpretation.

Music is a form of artistic expression that has been used in various higher education contexts (e. g. sociology, African American studies, counseling, etc.) to stimulate students' critical thinking and encourage them to examine, evaluate, and challenge previously held assumptions and worldviews (Levy & Byrd, 2011). There are multiple aspects of music that convey artistic expression; however, for the purposes of this article, artistic expression will refer primarily to the lyrics of a song. In matters of social injustice, the lyrics of a song often denounce power, privilege, discrimination, brutality, and violence.

Music from the CRM engaged activists by facilitating emotional release, spiritual uplift, consciousness raising, community organization, and communication across the color-line (Darden, 2014). Moving into a contemporary context, performance artists have drawn inspiration from BLM to use artistic expression to raise consciousness, increase solidarity, and inspire social movement action.

As a teaching strategy, students connect to music in ways that they do not connect to more traditional resources such as textbooks. Furthermore, this teaching strategy provides space for students to

share their own stories and experiences they may have gained from more personalized meaning

(Beyerbach, 2011). Consequently, students are quicker to identify patterns, comprehend issues, and less inclined to construct walls of resistance.

For people whose marginalization or subjugation is rendered invisible by the dominant culture, artistic expression is a medium to “turn the social gaze on their humanity, as well as a means to construct visions of self-determination” (Hanley, Noblit, Sheppard & Barone 2013, p 2). The humanistic work of artists can be a window through which students can access the intellectual, emotional, spiritual, and intuitive words of individuals or groups who are unrepresented in their classrooms, which can in turn provide a platform for critical consciousness raising.

For example, music of the CRM included traditional spirituals from the African American tradition— often performed with new verses which reflected the current political struggle—and new compositions in both secular and spiritual genres. The music of the CRM movement (often referred to as Freedom Songs) served a variety of functions including communicative, integrative, and symbolic roles (Rose, 2007). Additionally, Freedom Songs were intended to educate, edify, and liberate (Moss, 2001). Therefore, examining the aesthetics of music as symbols of human liberation is significant for helping educators acquire the knowledge and competencies needed to implement artistic expression into a social justice curriculum, as well as helping students make meaning of social injustice and place it in context with historical and contemporary recurring events.

Music of the Movements

The music of the CRM incorporated the communicative, representational, and integrative functions (Rose, 2007). The following section examines music associated with CRM performed by both Black and White musicians at rallies, organizing events, and fundraisers. The music of BlackLivesMatter expresses both pride in the community and resistance to oppression (Maultsby, 2018), while also fulfilling communicative, representational, and integrative functions. In the following sections, we will discuss several songs from the CRM canon which demonstrate different functions of music within social

movements. We will then analyze songs associated with BLM and discuss how they also perform communicative, representational and integrative functions.

Communicative Functions in CRM Music

The communicative function of CRM music was to “communicate direct information to those who understand the language in which it is couched” (Merriam, 1964, p 223). Freedom Songs often encouraged voter registration and participation in marches. They also “spread the message of the movement, and organize(d) networks of verbal communication” (Rose, 2007, p 59). Numerous traditional spirituals had lyrics rewritten by civil rights activists. The CRM versions often included strategic changes of a few words to shift the focus of the song from spiritual to earthly struggles. Other edits included additions of entirely new verses which addressed local and recent events in CRM. These modifications of spirituals were well within the music’s performance tradition which had always encouraged variations in lyrics and melodic approaches to popular songs. Freedom Songs were often organized around a congregational “call and response” pattern in which the song leader was free to call out a new lyric which would be incorporated into the next verse. For example, in the song, “Ain’t Gonna Let Nobody Turn You Round,” (The Freedom Singers, 1992) the chorus can be sung with any number of words substituting for the word “nobody.”

Ain’t gonna let nobody turn me round, (turn me round), turn me round
Aint gonna let nobody turn me ‘round,
I’m gonna keep on walkin’,
Keep on talkin,
Marchin’ into freedom land

In a purely religious rendering “nobody” might be substituted for “no devil,” “no temptation,” or “no backsliders” thus emphasizing the focus on marching into a heavily freedom land. In a CRM context “nobody” was often replaced with terms like “no mayor,” “no segregation,” “no jailhouse,” “no Uncle Toms,” or “no nervous-nillys” (The Freedom Singers, 1990) which shifted the focus to the worldly freedom struggle. These substitutions fulfilled the communicative function by providing warnings about potentially dangerous whites, teaching CRM participants about the value of facing the police and jail, and

warning against individuals who lacked the courage of their convictions as well as members of the Black community who allowed themselves to be used by racist Whites. In addition to fulfilling the communicative function, this song and other congregational songs facilitated integration between Black and White CRM activists because the melody and lyrical structure could be learned quickly. This facilitated group singing which in turn created a sense of solidarity and a starting point for further organizing (Darden, 2014).

Integrative Functions in CRM Music

The integrative function of Freedom Songs was to “integrate society and unite the public for a common purpose” (Rose, 2007, 64). Music was a key component of inspiring and solidifying interracial coalitions in CRM. Whites often got their first glimpses of Black culture by listening to Black targeted radio programs, and this exposure had a humanizing effect of the ways Whites viewed Blacks. Such early exposure to Black music has been linked to white participation in CRM (Darden, 2014). Once Whites became active in CRM, folk and gospel music served as socializing and solidarity-building functions (Watson, 2010). For many Blacks, early exposure to congregational singing provided a shared repertoire of songs that could help new combinations of Black activists to find common cultural ground.

When White folk singers such as Pete Seeger, Joan Baez, and Phil Ochs, performed African American spirituals to White or integrated audiences, they sensitized Whites to racial injustice while cultivating a commitment to interracial solidarity. Likewise, Black performers, such as Sister Rosetta Tharp, Nina Simone, Aretha Franklin, and Mahalia Jackson, who drew racially mixed audience provided Whites with humanizing images of Black people—which contradicted hundreds of years of racist images—and windows through which to view the African American freedom struggle. As Black and White musicians committed to CRM frequently performed at the same events, toured with interracial bands, and played covers of each other’s music, they were seen as public exemplars of interracial collaboration.

When singers of differing racial positionalities performed each other's songs, they often highlighted or reframed certain lyrical content. For example, when Sam Cooke covered Bob Dylan's "Blowing in the Wind," he transformed the line "how many roads must a man walk down, before we can call him a man." In Dylan's rendering the line can sound like a White youth's plea for respect from his elders. However, Cooke's rendition challenges the racist practice of referring to a Black man as "boy," and the broader struggle for full citizenship which this diminutive symbolized. Thus, the integrative aspect of civil rights music enhanced efforts to create symbolic representations of the movements' goals through re-rendering of lyrics from a different perspective.

Symbolic Representations in CRM music

The symbolic representational function of CRM songs was to both portray the horrors heaped on African Americans and allied activists as well as to articulate a vision of a peaceful and just future (Rose, 2007). Both Black and White artists created symbolic representations of injustice to help educate listeners about the need for participation in CRM, and also promoted images of how a more just society would look. Bob Dylan's (1964) "Only a Pawn in Their Game" is a prominent example of a representation of injustice as it narrates the murder of activist Medgar Evers and discusses the process by which poor Whites have become mis-educated into serving the interests of white supremacy.

These lyrics communicate the brutality and cowardice of Evers' murderers, hints at the ways elite Whites benefit from racism, and explains the investment that the White elites make in securing the loyalties of lower-class Whites.

An example of Black Gospel music which provides a representation of a hopeful future is "We Shall Not Be Moved." In this song, the first verse features the phrase "we shall not, we shall not be moved" but in subsequent verses this line can be substituted for phrases like "The Union is behind us," "We're Fighting for our freedom," "We're Fighting for our children," "We'll build a mighty union," and "Black and White together" (Staples, 2007). As singers work through the verses, the lyrics build a vision of a better world for protestors' children in which a mighty interracial union secures freedom for all. As

with “Ain’t Gonna Let Nobody Turn me Around,” the simple melody and lyrical style allow new initiates to sing along even the first time they hear the song, while also providing talented singers considerable artistic license to improvise melodies and harmonies to increase the emotional impact of the performance.

Communicative Functions in Music of BLM

Technological innovations in social media have enabled differing modes of social movement communications to increase and diversify, beyond the use of music, to spread the word regarding the specifics of injustice or to inform community members of upcoming protest activities. BLM protest music does, however, continue to communicate calls to action. One example is the chorus from Miguel’s “How Many:”

This song’s lyrics to communicate the need for community members to engage in BLM advocacy, to awaken from apathetic slumber, underscores such immediate need by highlighting symbolic representations of violence against African Americans. Harkening the call to “brothers and sisters” implores everyone, not just African Americans, to “wake up” to the history of racial injustice embedded in our society. This language of inclusion redirects social responsibility in learning through social movements to all who live in the present.

Symbolic Functions in the Music of BLM

The symbolic functions associated with music in BLM frequently depict instance of violence against African Americans. Such songs including Janelle Monae’s “Hell You Talmbout,” Bodycount’s “Black Hoodie,” JAG’s “Kaepernick Effect,” and more specifically Z-Ro’s “No Justice No Peace,” provide clear examples.

Z-Ro’s and other emotive descriptions of police violence in Black communities can assist mainstream audience to develop a deeper understanding of the suffocating fear that prompted the popularity of the “I Can’t Breathe” slogan. Developing an affective connection to such feelings of oppression can help learners appreciate how people occupying different positionalities have different emotional reactions to police presence. This can in turn move majority group members to a clearer

understanding of why “tough on crime” policies and the militarization of the modern American police force is so threatening to Black communities.

Integrative Functions in the music of BLM

Kendrick Lamar’s “Alright” (Lamar, 2015) fulfills the integrative function as its hook is frequently chanted at BLM rallies to both encourage protestors and increase group solidarity (Orejuela, 2018):

“Alright” achieves the integrative function on at least two levels. First, when a group sings the hook, it provides a social glue to integrate activists from varying backgrounds in much the same way that spirituals did during CRM. Second, the lyrical and melodic simplicity makes it easy for new initiates to join the chant and thus become part of the group. The song also connects the BLM movement to the long history of the African American freedom struggle as it, “echoes sonically a history of freedom songs created by African-descended people in the United States” (Orejuela, 2018, p. 1). Thus, the song facilitates a sense of community between current activists and enslaved Africans who sang spirituals, CRM activists who sang gospel, and O.G. Hip Hop artists who rap about the struggle (Darden, 2014; Orejuela, 2018). Ice Cube has described this sense of solidarity as being in a “continuum of one thought” (Goldman, 2016, 53) which underscores the historical and musical connections between racial justice movements throughout history.

In addition to the hook, certain lyrics from the verses underscore the sense of historical continuity in the African American freedom struggle. Lyrics in songs such as, “What you want, you a house you a car, Forty acres and Mule, A piano, a guitar?” connects current struggles for Black economic justice with parallel historical aspirations of freedmen and women to achieve financial independence in the face of exploitative economic systems. Meanwhile, the reference to the piano and guitar underscore the connection between Lamar’s music—which relies heavily on electronic production and instrumentation—to older forms of Black protest music that was accompanied by acoustic instruments.

Combining functions

Some songs, such as “Sad News” by Swizz Beatz, combine the three functions of social movement music. The first verse of this song performs the communicative function of relating a recent story of injustice. The chorus is integrative in nature, and the final verse combines communicative calls for actions against oppression with symbolic representations of a better world.

The chorus performs an integrative function of calling for racial solidarity, group mourning for the lost child, and communal prayer,

The third verse combines communicative work with symbolic function. The communicative work encourages BLM advocates to affirm Black culture while also engaging in political action against oppression. The verse also presents a symbolic image of a better and more equitable world in which there are, “No big I’s, and no little you’s,”

Applying the Social Justice Critical Reflection Model

In the SJCRM, descriptive thinking, dialogical thinking, critical reflection, critical consciousness, and praxis are applied to facilitate social justice learning. The songs previously discussed—as well as others from CRM and BLM—can be used in combination with one another to facilitate learner engagement in these five areas.

To facilitate interplay between multiple SJCRM domains learners can be prompted to develop multiple interpretations and hypothesize about the possibility of layered meanings in CRM or BLM songs. For example, in the song “Don’t Let Nobody Turn You Around,” a descriptive account might see the song about nothing encouragement that a person walks to a physical destination associated with freedom. However, dialogical thinking and critical reflection can help learners to recognize that the song can be interpreted on many levels including that it is: 1) built on Biblical references that reveal the song to

be a recounting of the journey that the Israelites undertook to escape slavery in Egypt; 2) a song that enslaved Africans could have used to inspire their own attempts to escape slavery; 3) a song that CRM participants could have used to inspire them in their struggle for enfranchisement; 4) a song that CRM participants could have used to encourage each other as they marched into hostile treatment from racist law enforcement.

Learners can also be prompted to consider the possibility of multiple and combined meanings. For example, the Biblical allusions recognized in the first interpretation can be understood as providing religious undertones to all subsequent interpretations, and thus conveying messages about the righteousness of the African American freedom struggle. Those aware of the Moses narrative from the Bible may also recognize that God frequently intervened on behalf of the Israelites as they journeyed on to freedom. When this recognition is connected to other interpretations learners can come to the understanding that some in the movement hoped for divine intervention in their struggle, and many more depended on God to sustain them in their efforts.

As learners come to recognize the interplay between multiple interpretations, this can facilitate critical consciousness raising in which learners develop greater aesthetic appreciation for the emotional, intellectual, and spiritual intricacies in relevant music, the CRM, and African American culture more broadly. Appreciation for the complexity of what might be initially viewed as a simple song can be an excellent starting point for a discussion of deficit versus community cultural wealth perspectives on African American culture (Yosso, 2006). The movement towards praxis can be facilitated through guided discussions about valuing historically unheard perspectives relative to diversity. In these discussions, organization members can be encouraged to come up with ways that such valuing perspectives can be applied within their occupational areas.

Implications for HRD Practice

Incorporating artistic expression into training and development activities by examining the music from CRM and BLM can educate members of an organization about the pain, beauty, and hope that exists within African American communities. HRD practitioners and educators can guide members of their organization in an exploration of the emotional and intellectual worlds captured in these songs, and use the music to center discussions around inequity.

When organizations conduct planned discussions around racial injustice, too often, the burden of educating Whites about minority cultures is placed on those who have experienced marginalization. Utilizing songs from social movements for racial justice can shelter People of Color from being thrust into that role because the songs cry the tears of oppression. Focusing discussion on the songs removes the expectation that participants must know and teach by encouraging all participants to strive to understand the perspectives of singers and songwriters. As participants grapple with the depth of narratives entangled with Black experiences from CRM to BLM, music can engage resistant participants by providing an emotional vantage point from which to develop empathy and lyrics can provide content for analytical engagement.

Implications for HRD Theory

Music as an artistic expression of social injustice is an underutilized educational strategy within HRD and has the potential to add intellectual nuance as well as the emotional impact to the field's developmental efforts. Additionally, the affective dimension of artistic expression makes it a powerful tool for educating around issues of social injustice. Additional research is needed to explore how different mediums of artistic expression and different musical genres can be used to stimulate learning relative to various domains of HRD. Additionally, existing literature around protest music produced between CRM and today could help learners to understand how racism has shifted and evolved in the last sixty years. Complexity could be added by including research on ways that music has represented and conveyed racial injustice experienced by other people of color. Likewise, research examining music produced in support

of causes related to environmentalism, gender, LGBTQ+ empowerment, class struggle, and advocacy related to people with disabilities would be fruitful.

Finally, HRD scholars and practitioners need more insight on social justice theory for application to the workplace. To some, actions taken in support of social movements can appear disorderly or out of proportion with specific acts of injustice that motivate protests. This is particularly relevant when there is a lack of an informed perspective of historical root causes of the event, leading to overly simplified understandings of what precipitated the social movement action. Moreover, with the emergence of social justice perspectives and critical social justice HRD, the field as a whole should strive to recognize new ways of thinking and learning about injustice. For example, Rawls (1999) theory of justice brings to light the imbalance of the distribution of fundamental rights. Critical Race Theory, discussed earlier in this article, explains the pervasive and recurring nature of racism. Feagin's (2006) theory of oppression highlights how the lingering effects of slavery are embedded in structural systems that sustain its endurance. Incorporating these and other theories related to social justice into HRD will better prepare members of our community to deconstruct and make meaning of social injustice.

Conclusion

Social movement learning provides unique opportunities to incorporate historical understandings of where structural impediments to social justice have influenced organizations. The emphasis on understanding historical elements of both injustice and social movements are important to the preparation of HRD professionals who work in ever-changing workplaces.

As workplaces change, the way that injustice presents in them changes as well. In the example of racism, Critical Race Theory (CRT) teaches us to reject the "standard racial progress narrative in which the history of race relations in the United States is one of linear uplift and improvement" (Dixson & Anderson, 2018), and rather to come to terms with the reality that racism is a permanent fixture in society, and that the ways in which racism manifests change overtime (Bell, 1992). These changes often make racism more subtle and thus more difficult for members of the dominant culture to recognize and

confront. The recognition that racism is and will continue to be endemic to organizational life and that it is impossible to predict how emerging iterations of organizational racism will appear, requires HRD communities to study both history and current day manifestations of racism if we hope to struggle against it effectively.

When confronted with the permanence of racism one might ask how can the effectiveness of a pedagogical teaching strategy be assessed for reducing racism? In response, we contend that attempts to numerically measure reductions in racism are illusionary (Bonilla-Silva, 2014; Wise, 2011), and defer to Bell's (1992) arguments that the value in struggling against racism is found in the humanizing nature of the struggle itself.

It is tempting to concede that assessing whether we are engaging in a humanizing struggle is impossible. However, Byrd's (2018) social justice paradigm for HRD suggests a way forward. We use this paradigm to self-assess whether our exercises were aligned with social justice HRD. Based on this criterion we believe that we met Byrd's first and third components of a social justice paradigm by shifting "conversations to the affective nature of actions that are unjust and uncivil" while aspiring to demonstrate a "concern for welfare, dignity, and respect for all people" that connects to a "concern for learning, growth, and development" (p. 8). We feel unable to assess our pedagogy regarding Byrd's second component of a social justice paradigm because—while we aspire to facilitate them— emancipation and transformation require more than just a few lessons taught using effective pedagogy. Our work can only lead to emancipation and transformation if it is part of a larger social movement towards social justice both in HRD and in the broader culture. We hope that this article will be useful in preparing future HRD scholars and practitioners to join in the struggle against workplace and societal injustice.

References

Alexander, M. (2010) *The New Jim Crow: Mass Incarceration in the Age of Colorblindness*. New York: The New Press.

Bohonos, J. W., Otchere, K. D., & Pak, y. (2019). Artistic expression as a teaching strategy for social movements: deepening understandings of the civil rights and #blacklivesmatter movements. *Advances in developing human resources*, 21(2), 250-266. Doi.org/10.1177/1523422319827942 21

Bell, D. (1992). *Faces at the bottom of the well: The permanence of racism*. New York City, NY: Basic Books.

Bell, L. A. (2007). Theoretical foundations for social justice education. In Adams, M., Bell, L. A., & Griffin, P. (Eds.), *Teaching for diversity and social justice* (pp. 3-15). New York: Routledge.

Beatz, S. (2016) Sad News. On *Sad News*. [Mp3]. Stockholm, Sweden: Monza Music Group

Beyerbach, B. (2011). Social Justice Education Through the Arts. *Counterpoints*, 403, Engaging Students in Global Issues through the Arts, pp. 1-14.

Bierema, L. L. (2010a). *Implementing a critical approach to organization development*. Malabar, FL: Krieger.

Bierema, L. L. (2010b). Diversity education: Competencies and strategies for educators. *Advances in Human Resources*, 12(3), 312-331.

Bierema, L. L. (2010c). Resisting HRD's resistance to diversity. *Journal of European Industrial Training*, 34(6), 565-576.

Bierema, L. L., & Callahan, J. L. (2014). Transforming HRD: A framework for critical HRD practice. *Advances in Developing Human Resources*, 16(4), 429-444.

Bohonos, J. W. (2016). (2016). Social justice in human resource development: A review of literature. In Moats, J. Amayah, A. T., & Yawson, R. (Ed.), *International Research Conference in the Americas*. Jacksonville, FL: The Academy of Human Resource Development.

Bohonos, J. W., Otchere, K. O., & Pak, Y. (Accepted pending revisions, 2019). Teaching and learning social justice in HRD. *New Horizons in Adult Education and Human Resource Development*.

Bonilla-Silva, E. (2014). *Racism without Racists: Color-Blind Racism and the Persistence of Racial Inequity in America, Fourth Edition*. Lanham: Maryland. Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.

Brewer, R. M., & Heitzeg, N. A. (2008). The racialization of crime and punishment: Criminal justice, color-blind racism, and the political economy of the prison industrial complex. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 51(5), 625-644. doi:10.1177/0002764207307745

Bohonos, J. W., Otchere, K. D., & Pak, y. (2019). Artistic expression as a teaching strategy for social movements: deepening understandings of the civil rights and #blacklivesmatter movements. *Advances in developing human resources*, 21(2), 250-266. Doi.org/10.1177/1523422319827942 22

Butler, J. (2006). *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the subversion of identity*. New York City, NY: Routledge.

Byrd, M. (2012). Theorizing leadership of demographically diverse leaders. In M. Paludi (Ed.), *Managing diversity in today's workplace: Strategies for employees and employers Women and careers in management* (pp. 103–124). Santa Barbara, CA: Praeger (ABC-CLIO).

Byrd, M. Y. (2018a). Does HRD have a moral duty to respond to matters of social injustice? *Human Resource Development International*, 21, 3-11. doi:10.1080/13678868.2017.1344419

Byrd, M. Y. (2018b). *Diversity branding promotes a valuing philosophy but where is the social justice*. Presentation at the Academy of Human Resources Development 2018 Conference in the Americas, Richmond, VA.

Byrd, M. Y., & Stanley, C.A. (Eds.). (2009). Giving voice: The socio-cultural realities of African American women's leadership experiences (Special issue). *Advances in Developing Human Resources*, 11(5).

Chernega, J. (2016). Black Lives Matter: Racialised Policing in the United States. *Comparative American Studies An International Journal*, 14(3-4), DOI:10.1080/14775700.2016.1267322

Clayton, D. M. (2018). Black Lives Mater and the Civil Rights Movement: A Comparative Analysis of Two Social Movements in the United States. *Journal of Black Studies*, 49(5), 448-480.

Crenshaw, K. (1989). Demarginalizing the intersection of race and sex: A Black feminist critique of antidiscrimination doctrine, feminist theory, and antiracist politics. *The University of Chicago Legal Forum*, 140:139-167.

Darden, R. (2014). *Nothing but Love in God's Water: Black Sacred Music from the Civil War to the Civil Rights Movement*. University Park, PA: The Pennsylvania State University Press.

Dixson, A. D. & Anderson, C. R. (2018) Where are We? Critical Race Theory in Education 20 Years Later. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 93(1), 121-131, DOI: 10.1080/0161956X.2017.1403194

- Bohonos, J. W., Otchere, K. D., & Pak, y. (2019). Artistic expression as a teaching strategy for social movements: deepening understandings of the civil rights and #blacklivesmatter movements. *Advances in developing human resources*, 21(2), 250-266. Doi.org/10.1177/1523422319827942 23
- Duguid, F., Mündel, K., & Schugurensky, D. (2007). Volunteer work, informal learning, and the quest for sustainable communities in Canada. *Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education*, 20(2), 41-56.
- DuVernay, A. (Director & Writer) & Averick, S. (Writer) (2016). *13th: From Slave to Criminal with One Amendment* [Documentary Film]. Los Gatos, California: Netflix
- Dylan, Bob (1964) Only a Pawn in Their Game. On *The Times they are a Changing* [Record]. New York: Columbia
- Feagin, J. (2006). *Systemic racism. A theory of oppression*. London: Routledge.
- Freedom Singers, The (1992) Ain't Gonna Let Nobody Turn You Round. On *Sing for Freedom: The Story of the Civil Rights Movement Through Its Songs* [Compact Disk]. Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Folkways.
- Garrow, D.J. (1987). *Bearing the Cross: Martin Luther King, Jr., and the Southern Leadership Conference*. New York: Open Road Integrated Media.
- Garza, A. (2014). A herstory of the #BlackLivesMatter by Alicia Garza. *The Feminist Wire*. Retrieved from <https://thefeministwire.com/2014/10/blacklivesmatter-2/>
- Gedro, J., Collins, J. C., & Rocco, T. S. (2014). The “critical” turn: An important imperative for human resource development. *Advances in Developing Human Resources*, 16(4), 529-535.
- Gedro, J., & Mizzi, R. C. (2014). Feminist theory and queer theory: Implications for HRD research and practice. *Advances in Developing Human Resources*, 16(4), 445-456.
- Goldman, J. (2016) “Of Ice Cube: The Hemi” Q&A.” *Hemispheres Magazine*. April: 52-55.
- Hanley, M. S. (2013) Introduction. In *Culturally Relevant Arts Education for Social Justice: A Way Out of No Way*. Hanley, M. S., Noblit, G. W., Sheppard, G. L., and Barone, T. (Eds.) New York: Routledge
- Harris, C. I. (1993). Whiteness as property. *Harvard Law Review*, 106(8), 1707-1791.

Bohonos, J. W., Otchere, K. D., & Pak, y. (2019). Artistic expression as a teaching strategy for social movements: deepening understandings of the civil rights and #blacklivesmatter movements. *Advances in developing human resources*, 21(2), 250-266. Doi.org/10.1177/1523422319827942 24

Ingram, I. L., & Walters, T. S. (2007). A critical reflection model to teach diversity and social justice.

Journal of Praxis in Multicultural Education, 2(1), 23-41.

Jones-Eversley, S. J., Adedoyin, C.A., Robinson, M. A., Moore, S. E. (2017) *Protesting Black Inequality:*

A Commentary on the Civil Rights Movement and Black Lives Matter. *Journal of Community Practice*, 25(3-4), 309-324, DOI:10.1080/10705422.2017.1367343

Lamar, K. (2015) *Alright. On To Pimp a Butterfly* [Mp3]. Los Angeles, CA: Top Dawg Entertainment.

Levy, D. L., & Byrd, D. C. (2011). Why can't we be friends? Using music to teach social justice. *Journal of the Scholarship of Teaching and Learning*, 11(2), 64-75.

Lopez, I. F. H. (1997). Race, ethnicity, erasure: The salience of race to LatCrit theory. *California Law Review*, 85(5), 1143-1211.

Maultsby, P. (2018) *Forward*. In Orejuela, F. & Shonekan, S. (Eds.), *Black Lives Matter & Music: Protest, Intervention, reflection*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.

McLean, G. N., & McLean, L. D. (2001). If we can't define HRD in one country, how can we define it in an international context? *Human Resource Development International*, 4(3), 313-326.

Merriam, A. P. (1964) *The Anthropology of Music*. Evanston, IL: Northwestern University Press.

Moss, O. (2001). *Introduction*. In Carpenter, D. & Williams N. E. (Eds.) *The African American Heritage Hymnal: 575 Hymns, Spirituals, and Gospel Songs*. Chicago, IL: GIA Publications

North, C. E. (2006). More than words? Delving into the substantive meaning(s) of "Social Justice" in Education. *Review of Educational Research*, 76(4), 507-535.

Omi, M., & Winant, H. (2015). *Racial formation in the United States* (3rd ed.). New York City, NY: Routledge.

Orejuela, F. (2018). *Introduction*. In Orejuela, F. & Shonekan, S. (Eds) *Black Lives Matter & Music: Protest, Intervention, Reflection*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.

Bohonos, J. W., Otchere, K. D., & Pak, y. (2019). Artistic expression as a teaching strategy for social movements: deepening understandings of the civil rights and #blacklivesmatter movements. *Advances in developing human resources*, 21(2), 250-266. Doi.org/10.1177/1523422319827942 25

Pleasant, S. (2017). Perspectives in HRD—Crossing the boundaries of employee engagement and workplace diversity and inclusion: Moving HRD forward in a complicated sociopolitical climate. *New Horizons in Adult Education and Human Resources Development*, 29(3), 38-44.

Rawls, J. (1999). *A theory of justice* (rev. ed.). Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Rocco, T. S., Bernier, J. D., & Bowman, L. (2014). Critical race theory and HRD: Moving race front and center. *Advances in Developing Human Resources*, 16(4), 457-470.

Rocco, T. S., & Gallagher, S. J. (2006). Straight privilege and moral/izing: Issues in career development. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 2006(112), 29-39. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1002/ace.234>

Rose, L. P. (2007) *The Freedom Singers of the Civil Rights Movement: Music Functioning for Freedom*. *Applications of Research in Music Education* 25(2), 59-68.

Scandrett, E., Crowther, J., Hemmi, A., Mukherjee, S., Shah, D., & Sen, T. (2010). Theorizing education and learning in social movements: Environmental justice campaigns in Scotland and India. *Studies in the Education of Adults*, 42(2), 124-140.

Staples, M. (2007). *We Shall not be Moved*. On *We'll Never Turn Back*. Hollywood, CA: Anti/Epitaph.

Watson, B. (2010) *Freedom Summer: The Savage Season of 1964 That Made Mississippi Burn and Made America a Democracy*. New York, New York: Penguin Books.

Wise, T. (2011). *White Like Me: Reflections on Race from a Privileged Son*, revised edition. New York: Soft Skull Press.

Yosso, T. J. (2005) Whose culture has capital: a critical race theory discussion of community cultural wealth. *Race Ethnicity and Education* 8(1), p. 69-91.

Z-Ro's (2016, July 8). No Justice No Peace. [Video File] Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QMI3UTx9-zg&start_radio=1&list=RDQMI3UTx9-zg&t=2

-
-