

DEWEY, DUMBLEDORE'S ARMY, AND DEFENSE AGAINST THE DARK ARTS:
THE INTELLECTUAL DEVELOPMENT
OF HARRY POTTER AT
HOGWARTS

THESIS

Presented to the Graduate Council of
Texas State University-San Marcos
in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements

for the Degree

Master of ARTS

by

Kandace Lytle, B.A.

San Marcos, Texas
May 2009

COPYRIGHT

by

Kandace Lytle

2009

DEDICATION

For Tracy and Kristin Lytle.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank my thesis director Dr. Graeme Wend-Walker for his encouragement, guidance, and friendship throughout the writing process. I would also like to thank Dr. Caroline Jones and Dr. Jo Ann Carson for their cooperation and support during my project. I would like to acknowledge Dr. Craig Hanks; his friendship over the past year is much appreciated.

To my family, without your constant encouragement and love I would not have such a solid sense of self or understand the importance of watching a dream come to fruition. Thank you for your love and support!

I would like to thank my beagle Rowdy for his constant tail wagging, puppy kisses, and turn-of-the-head confused looks. He provides me with laughter and serenity during the most stressful times.

This manuscript was submitted on April 15, 2009

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	v
INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER	
I. REMUS LUPIN.....	9
II. MAD EYE MOODY	16
III. GILDEROY LOCKHART	23
IV. QUIRINUS QUIRRELL	33
V. DOLORES UMBRIDGE: A NEGATIVE EXAMPLE	36
VI. DEALING WITH THE DISCIPLINARIAN: HARRY'S DETENTIONS WITH DOLORES UMBRIDGE.....	51
VII. DUMBLEDORE'S ARMY: POTTER'S PEDAGOGY	55
VIII. CONCLUSION	69
BIBLIOGRAPHY	72

INTRODUCTION

Over the past twelve years, critics have scrutinized J.K. Rowling's Harry Potter series for its familiar and formulaic presentation of fantasy and for what many critics assert as Rowling's inability to produce an original work. Alessandra Petrina's article "Forbidden Forest, Enchanted Castle: Arthurian Spaces in the Harry Potter Novels" and John Pennington's "From Elfland to Hogwarts, or the Aesthetic Trouble with Harry Potter" both discuss and promote this type of negative criticism and focus on what Jack Zipes presented as the key problem of the texts: "What appears as something phenomenal turns or is turned into its opposite through a process of homogenization: the phenomenal thing or occurrence must become a conventional commodity that can be grasped or consumed to fit our cultural expectations" (174). The homogenization of the Harry Potter novels undercuts its own phenomenal status and points to Rowling's own inability to create an original and unconventional world, rather than rely on her own surroundings—British boarding schools, the Muggle world—to create her series.

Arguably, however, it is the incorporation of this type of mimesis in fantastic literature that enables the reader to connect to the magical aspects of Rowling's non-Muggle world. Pennington relies on Kathryn Hume's definition of "mimesis—'the desire to imitate'—and fantasy—which 'desires to change givens to alter reality'" to reject Rowling's credibility (79). Contrastingly, in "Strategies of Fantasy," Brian Attebery uses Hume's definition to prove the credibility of fantasy, even when it appears both imitative

and formulaic: “As Kathryn Hume points out, fantasy and mimesis are the fundamental operations of the narrative imagination...we might say that mimesis tells what is and fantasy tells what isn’t” (3). Rowling’s reliance upon the authentic world sparks a connection between the reader’s own surroundings and the fantastic world of Hogwarts. Thus, it is the blending of these two modes that enables Rowling to successfully create Hogwarts School of Witchcraft and Wizardry. Attebery further discusses the relationship between mimesis and fantasy: “Fantasy without mimesis would be a purely artificial invention, without recognizable objects or actions. Even if such a completely fantastic story could be written, no one could read it with any understanding or pleasure. Fantasy depends on mimesis for its effectiveness” (3-4). It is the familiarity and effectiveness of mimesis in Rowling’s series that enables the reader to connect with characters in a setting that is fantastic but that also resembles the British boarding school tradition and that stylistically recalls fantasy *bildungsroman* novels about young, incapable male protagonists thrust into the role of savior and apprentice/student simultaneously. The first comparison recalls the spirit of novels like Hughes’s *Tom Brown’s School Days* and Kipling’s *Stalky & Co*; the latter refers to classic characters such as: Tolkien’s Frodo in the Lord of the Rings series, Card’s Ender in the Ender series, Pullman’s Lyra (a female protagonist) and Will in *His Dark Materials*, and White’s Arthur in *The Once and Future King*; all of which are separated from their parents—whether orphaned like Harry or removed from their home like Ender—in order to fulfill their destiny. Although Rowling borrows from these traditions, her ability to blend the two—boarding school story and epic *bildungsroman*—makes the Harry Potter series an interesting focus for educational critique. Rowling’s ability to imitate the real and create the magical causes Hogwarts to

become an institution worth examining philosophically. Although the mimetic faculty of Rowling's series is an interesting topic, it is Harry's educational experience at Hogwarts that is necessary to critique: "As in the best school stories, Hogwarts is seen from the pupils' perspective. They are apparently allowed enormous freedom of decision-making, a freedom which Harry uses to great effect; peer rules apply to daily interaction and teachers behave with all the apparent unpredictability of both their real and their fictional counterparts" (Eccleshare 49-50). Exploring the problematic nature of freedom and direction in relation to education using the philosopher John Dewey illuminates the aspects of Rowling's series that cause Harry's story to express originality—the creation of the self through the exploration of interests and passions—a quality of Hogwarts that causes Harry to move from student to teacher by the fifth novel.

The majority of the *Harry Potter* series is located at Hogwarts, an academy for young witches and wizards modeled after a classic British boarding school education system. Despite being based on this particular model, Rowling blends classical and progressive education practices at Hogwarts; it functions as a school that provides both experience-based and lecture-based knowledge. Although the students study subjects different from our own (Herbology, Defense Against the Dark Arts, Charms, Transfiguration, Potions, etc.), the pedagogical practices that occur at Hogwarts furnish readers with classroom and social experiences similar to that of both British and American educational systems. Reading *Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix* with American educational reformer John Dewey's philosophical essays *The Child and the Curriculum*, *Experience and Education* and *My Pedagogic Creed* contextualizes the relationship between Harry and his Defense Against the Dark Arts teachers at Hogwarts.

Although Dewey is an American philosopher known for discussing problems he noticed in the American school system, his maxims and aims for educational reform are arguably universal. Dewey advocates educational reform that promotes effective teaching pedagogies and creates well-balanced students. According to Dewey the students need to both psychologize the subject matter and experience the material taught in order for their lessons to have educational value. Therefore, discussing a text modeled after the traditional British boarding school story in relation to Dewey promotes the type of critique and reform of educational practices Dewey advocated. He constructed a theoretical system designed to improve educational practices, and aspired to create diverse individuals, each fashioned through exposure to various types of knowledge offering students a liberal outlook on what it means to be educated. Dewey believes that education should begin with the interests of the child, rather than a pre-determined curriculum. In *The Child and the Curriculum* he asserts the importance of the development of the child through a unified educative process: “The fundamental factors in the educative process are an immature, underdeveloped being; and certain social aims, meanings, values incarnate in the matured experience of the adult. The educative process is the due interaction of these forces. Such a conception of each in relation to the other as facilitates the completest and freest interaction is the essence of educational theory” (Dewey 276). Thus, in preparing students for adulthood, the child must interact with society in order to mature. Throughout the Harry Potter series, Harry is exposed to the social world of adults, especially in his interaction with professors, the headmaster and the Order of the Phoenix. Harry’s maturation depends on the knowledge these adults impart—this relates to the apprentice/student who is “the chosen one”—in order to fulfill

his destiny (Harry's future has been prophesied by Professor Trelawney). Dewey relates the maturing of the child to what he calls the democratic ideal in *Democracy and Education*. He proposes that the two necessary elements in creating a promising democracy are common interest, interaction, and adaptability (Dewey 292). Without these two components, the individual can become isolated and belong to an exclusive clique that is merely teaching him or her to be a 'type of person' in society. This problem is illustrated throughout the Harry Potter series with the discussion of the division of houses, Quidditch teams, and the competitive nature of Hogwarts. Dewey relates democracy to the socialization a student should receive during his or her education:

A democracy is more than a form of government; it is primarily a mode of associated living, of conjoint communicated experience. The extension of space of the number of individuals who participate in an interest so that each has to refer his own action to that of others, and to consider the action of others to give point and direction to his own, is equivalent to the breaking down of those barriers of class, race, and national territory which kept men from perceiving the full import of their activity. (Dewey 292)

Dewey's main argument is that it is necessary for an academy to advocate the socialization of students in an educational environment that promotes the development of chameleonic individuals who possess the ability to adapt and change within a society when necessary. He proposed experiential education, a hands-on approach that encourages social activity and collaborative learning among students, as a solution to this problem. Both *My Pedagogic Creed* and *The Child and the Curriculum* present methodology for creating such individuals. In order to initiate true intellectual development within students, Dewey suggested integrating action-based activities that stimulate recreation, communication, and cooperation, rather than lectures and note-taking to better prepare students to become members of society. His observation of the

differences between social and institutional knowledge caused him to propound that both types of learning should occur in an academic setting. This type of socialization is seen at Hogwarts; although the students are initially divided into four houses (Hufflepuff, Slytherin, Gryffindor, Ravenclaw), they must co-exist within the school system. The students take classes together, compete in Quidditch tournaments, and come together during the Tri-Wizard tournament, in which the house divisions no longer matter because all want a Hogwarts victory. The hosting of the Tri-Wizard tournament promotes the socialization and globalization that Dewey advocates. Harry promotes this type of socialization and collaborative learning himself when Hermione and he form Dumbledore's Army. The education Harry Potter receives at Hogwarts blends both the traditional and progressive theories of education; using Dewey's educational theory to discuss Harry's development at Hogwarts provides a critical and philosophical lens for examining Hogwarts weaknesses and strengths as a social and educational institution.

Harry's Defense Against the Dark Arts professors provide Harry with necessary skills that he uses when he encounters Lord Voldemort at the end of each novel (with the exception of *Harry Potter and The Prisoner of Azkaban*). Throughout the Harry Potter series Harry's Defense Against the Dark Arts instructors' duty is to expose students to the harmful nature of the Dark Arts; some do this methodically (Quirrell), while others believe the classroom should be used to praise their achievements (Lockhart) and finally others find it a valuable and safe setting to actually expose students to how difficult it is to face one's own worst fears (Lupin and Moody). Unlike the other Defense Against the Dark Arts teachers, Dolores Umbridge, a woman elected to instruct the Defense Against the Dark Arts class by the Ministry of Magic rather than by

Dumbledore—the headmaster who has appointed all of the other professors—does not provide students with tools necessary to battle the Dark Arts in the real world or even on their O.W.L. exams. The O.W.L. (Ordinary Wizarding Level) exams are standardized tests in which the students must write an essay, perform magic, or do a combination of both to illustrate their knowledge of the subjects taught at Hogwarts. This type of examination combines illustrating knowledge both experientially (performance of magic) and linguistically (the written portion of the exam) and supports Dewey’s belief that the student must be able to perform socially in both regards. Interestingly, “Harry Potter and the Freedom of Information: Knowledge and Control in *Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix*” asserts: “Although Harry and most of his classmates speak about OWLs with fearful reverence, the validity of the tests as an accurate measure of knowledge is questionable” (Flaherty 97).

An assessment of the Defense Against the Dark Arts teachers, their practices, and expectations in relation to Dewey’s philosophical essays provides an epistemological reading of Harry’s educational progress at Hogwarts. Beginning with a discussion of Harry’s professors who illustrate the progressive and experiential type of education Dewey supports, we will then move to an examination of professors who are incapable of implementing progressive pedagogy and resort to traditional methods within the classroom—specifically the most problematic professor Harry encounters, Dolores Umbridge—provides an opportunity for a critical comparison and evaluation of the other Hogwarts professors, specifically Harry’s earlier Defense Against the Dark Arts instructors. This critical evaluation leads to an examination of the academic caliber of Hogwarts in relation to Dewey’s philosophy as set out in *My Pedagogic Creed*, *The Child*

and the Curriculum, and *Experience and Education*. Finally, I will examine Harry as a teacher—the leader of Dumbledore’s Army—and discusses his experience in relation to his Defense Against the Dark Arts professors and Dewey’s educational philosophy.

CHAPTER I

REMUS LUPIN

Of all Harry's Defense Against the Dark Arts professors Remus Lupin is the strongest advocate of progressive, experiential education. Lupin teaches Harry during his third year at Hogwarts and provides Harry with the necessary tools to battle the Dark Arts both inside and outside of school. Lupin's first lesson begins with what Lupin calls a practical lesson:

“Good afternoon,” he said. “Would you please all put your books back in your bags. Today's will be a practical lesson. You will only need your wands.”

A few curious looks were exchanged as the class put away their books. They had never had a practical Defense Against the Dark Arts before, unless you counted the memorable class last year when their old teacher had brought a cageful of pixies to class and set them loose. (*Prisoner of Azkaban* 130)

Lupin guides his students into Defense Against the Dark Arts with a practical lesson on boggarts. He begins his lesson asking for a volunteer to give their definition of a boggart; of course, Hermione provides the class with a definition: “It's a shape-shifter...It can take the shape of whatever it thinks will frighten us most” (*Prisoner of Azkaban* 133). Lupin praises the clarity of Hermione's definition and asks the class to consider how to outsmart a boggart; Harry replies: “Er—because there are so many of us, it won't know what shape it should be?” (*Prisoner of Azkaban* 134). Here, Lupin describes his own experience with a boggart and relates it to Harry's answer:

“Precisely,” said Professor Lupin, and Hermione put her hand down, looking a little disappointed. “It’s always best to have company when you’re dealing with a boggart. He becomes confused. Which should he become, a headless corpse or a flesh-eating slug? I once saw a boggart make that very mistake—tried to frighten two people at once and turned himself into half a slug. Not remotely frightening.” (*Prisoner of Azkaban* 134)

Lupin’s description of Harry’s method proves both his expertise in the subject and shows that he has first-hand experience fighting creatures of the Dark Arts. He then explains to the students that laughter is what defeats a boggart and teaches them the *Riddikulus* charm. Lupin gives Neville Longbottom a vital role in the process of defeating the boggart, which shows that Lupin is able to motivate the most troubled and frightened students with encouragement and exciting application (*Prisoner of Azkaban* 134-5). After illustrating and instructing how to perform the *Riddikulus* charm, the students line up to attack the boggart. This is why Lupin describes his lesson as a practical one; he defines the subject, explains the theory, allows them to apply the theory, and then the students actually experience the subject and apply the theory simultaneously. Lupin concludes his lesson with a homework assignment—reading about the boggart from the book and writing a short essay summarizing the chapter—so the students can deepen their understanding of the subject and theory. In assigning a textbook lesson outside of the classroom, Lupin creates time in his classroom for experiential education using practical lessons. Lupin understands Dewey’s argument, that

[t]he child is the starting-point, the centre, and the end. His development, his growth, is the ideal. It alone furnishes the standard. To the growth of the child all studies are subservient; they are instruments valued as they serve the needs to growth. Personality, character, is more than subject-matter. Not knowledge or information, but self-realization, is the goal. To possess all the world of knowledge and lose one’s own self is as awful a fate in education as in religion.

Moreover, subject-matter never can be got into the child from without. Learning is active. It involves reaching out of the mind. It involves organic assimilation starting from within. Literally, we must take our stand with the child and our departure from him. It is he and not the subject-matter which determines both quality and quantity of living. (Dewey 278)

He creates a classroom that promotes active learning and places students in the “centre” of his practical lessons. The subject matter—in this case, the boggart—becomes an instrument, rather than the focus, causing the students, especially Neville, to gain self-confidence when battling the boggart. Furthermore, Lupin continues giving the same type of lesson, which creates enthusiasm for the subject and confidence in battling the Dark Arts:

In no time at all, Defense Against the Dark Arts had become most people’s favorite class...His next few lessons were just as interesting as the first. After boggarts, they studied Red Caps, nasty little goblinlike creatures that lurked wherever there had been bloodshed: in the dungeons of castles and the potholes of deserted battlefields, waiting to bludgeon those who had gotten lost. From Red Caps they moved on to kappas, creepy water-dwellers that looked like scaly monkeys, with webbed hands itching to strangle unwitting waders in the ponds. (*Prisoner of Azkaban*, 141)

Lupin’s consistency in practical application and his advocacy of the necessity of experience and practice when defending oneself against the Dark Arts is also promoted by the type of final exam Lupin gives his students at the end of the semester:

Their second to last exam, on Thursday morning, was Defense Against the Dark Arts. Professor Lupin had compiled the most unusual exam any of them had ever taken; a sort of obstacle course outside in the sun, where they had to wade across a deep paddling pool containing a grindylow, cross a series of potholes full of Red Caps, squish their way across a patch of marsh while ignoring misleading directions from a hinkypunk, then climb into an old trunk and battle with a boggart. (*Prisoner of Azkaban* 318)

Lupin's final exam is an amalgamation of all of his lessons, which provides the students with a test that examines both their abilities to perform well against the Dark Arts and to demonstrate that their practice and knowledge of the subject is transferable from Hogwarts to the real world.

Interestingly, the most important lesson Harry learns from Lupin does not occur in the classroom. Lupin offers to give Harry private anti-dementor lessons in which he intends to teach Harry a higher level of magic—the ability to conjure a Patronus. During these lessons, Lupin exemplifies Dewey's belief in the necessity of a teacher helping a student self-actualize and realize his or her own interests and capabilities:

To prepare him for the future life means to give him command of himself; it means so to train him that he will have the full and ready use of all his capacities; that his eye and ear and hand may be tools ready to command, that his judgment may be capable of grasping the conditions under which it has to work, and the executive forces be trained to act economically and efficiently. It is impossible to reach this sort of adjustment save as constant regard is had to the individual's own powers, tastes, and interests—say, that is, as education is continually converted into psychological terms. (Dewey 230)

Lupin conducts his first lesson with Harry in the same manner he instructs his first class. He begins by defining the Patronus: “The Patronus is a kind of positive force, a projection of the very things that the dementor feeds upon—hope, happiness, the desire to survive—but it cannot feel despair, as real humans can, so the dementors can't hurt it. But I must warn you, Harry, that the charm might be too advanced for you. Many qualified wizards have difficulty with it” (*Prisoner of Azkaban* 237). Harry asks what a Patronus looks like and Lupin explains that “Each one is unique to the wizard who conjures it” (*Prisoner of Azkaban* 237). Like the boggart lesson, Lupin moves from the definition of the subject to a detailed explanation of the theory of the incantation used to

conjure the Patronus and recounts the method of conjuring the Patronus to Harry as he is practicing. Lupin tells Harry he must concentrate hard on a happy memory while performing the incantation (*Prisoner of Azkaban* 238). After practicing a few times, Lupin allows Harry to practice on a boggart that will take the shape of what Harry fears most, in his case, the dementors. Harry has difficulty performing his Patronus against this force throughout his lessons with Lupin. He becomes frustrated with himself:

To make matters even worse, Harry's anti dementor lessons were not going nearly as well as he had hoped. Several sessions on, he was able to produce an indistinct, silvery shadow every time the boggart-dementor approached him, but his Patronus was too feeble to drive the dementor away. All it did was hover, like a semi-transparent cloud, draining Harry of energy as he fought to keep it there. Harry felt angry with himself... (*Prisoner of Azkaban* 246)

Lupin recognizes Harry's frustration and reassures Harry: "I have complete confidence in you" (*Prisoner of Azkaban* 246). Lupin's support of Harry and willingness to answer any of Harry's questions causes Harry to become more ambitious and his devotion for Defense Against the Dark Arts to develop. Lupin does not force Harry into these lessons; instead he creates an honest and open learning environment for Harry. When Harry asks Lupin to describe dementors to him, Lupin does so without hesitation. Lupin recognizes Harry's own situation and often motivates Harry, explaining that the grim nature of his past and the tribulations Harry has gone through with Voldemort are his strength. Lupin values Harry's personal experience with the Dark Arts and asserts that Harry's past experiences relate directly to his Patronus and classroom lessons. As a teacher, Lupin exemplifies Dewey's assertion that: "Guidance is not external imposition. *It is freeing the life-process for its own most adequate fulfillment*" (Dewey 281). Lupin's Patronus lessons come to fruition when Harry uses the Patronus charm during a Quidditch game, the original reason Harry began to take the lessons from Lupin:

Three dementors, three tall, black, hooded dementors, were looking up at him.

He didn't stop to think. Plunging a hand down the neck of his robes, he whipped out his wand and roared, "Expecto Patronum!"

Something silver-white, something enormous, erupted from the end of his wand. He knew it had shot directly at the dementors but didn't pause to watch...

"That was quite some Patronus," said a voice in Harry's ear.

Harry turned around to see Professor Lupin, who looked both shaken and pleased.

"The dementors didn't affect me at all!" Harry said excitedly. "I didn't feel a thing!"

"That would be because they—er—weren't dementors," said Professor Lupin. "Come and see—"

He led Harry out of the crowd until they were able to see the edge of the field.

"You gave Mr. Malfoy quite a fright," said Lupin. (*Prisoner of Azkaban* 263)

Although Harry does not battle actual dementors during the Quidditch game, Lupin's compliment and Harry's performance of the charm against his enemy at school builds Harry's confidence. At the conclusion of the novel, Harry performs his Patronus in order to save innocent lives:

Harry flung himself out from behind the bush and pulled out his wand.

"EXPECTO PATRONUM!" he yelled.

And out of the end of his wand burst, not a shapeless cloud of mist, but a blinding, dazzling, silver animal. He screwed up his eyes, trying to see what it

was. It looked like a horse. It was galloping silently away from him, across the black surface of the lake. He saw it lower its head and charge at the swarming dementors...Now it was galloping around and around the black shapes on the ground, and the dementors were falling back, scattering, retreating into the darkness...They were gone.

The Patronus turned. It was cantering back toward Harry across the still surface of the water. It wasn't a horse. It wasn't a unicorn either. It was a stag. It was shining brightly as the moon above...it was coming back to him...

It stopped on the bank. Its hooves made no mark on the soft ground as it stared at Harry with its large, silver eyes. Slowly it bowed its antlered head. And Harry realized...

“Prongs,” he whispered. (*Prisoner of Azkaban* 411-12)

Harry's ability to perform a difficult charm during a life-threatening situation relates to his past experience with such situations. Lupin constantly reminds Harry of the relationship between practice and practical application. Even Hermione is impressed by Harry's capabilities, exclaiming, “Harry I can't believe it... You conjured up a Patronus that drove away all those dementors! That's very, *very* advanced magic...” (412) . Harry applies the practice Lupin facilitates to his real world experience with danger and the Dark Arts throughout the series. Later in the series, Lupin's lessons also greatly influence Harry's method of teaching when he forms Dumbledore's Army. He teaches other students to use a Patronus to ward off evil and even performs his Patronus during his Defense Against the Dark Arts O.W.L. examination for extra points.

CHAPTER II

MAD-EYE MOODY

Unlike the other Defense Against the Dark Arts professors Harry encounters, Mad-Eye Moody provides his students with a classroom in which they witness and personally experience the Dark Arts. Mad-Eye Moody is known as one of the best Aurors the Ministry of Magic ever employed because “[h]alf the cells in Azkaban are full because of him” (*Goblet of Fire* 161-62). When Moody first arrives on campus he immediately impresses the students when he transfigures Malfoy from human to ferret to protect Harry (*Goblet of Fire* 204-5). McGonagall informs Moody that the professors “*never* use transfiguration as punishment” (*Goblet of Fire* 206). Moody’s incident with Malfoy immediately causes Harry to appreciate Moody as a professor and sparks his interest when the Weasleys begin to discuss their first class with him:

“Moody!” [Fred Weasley] said. “How cool is he?”

“Beyond cool,” said George, sitting down opposite Fred.

“Supercool,” said the twins’ best friend, Lee Jordan, sliding into the seat beside George. “We had him this afternoon,” he told Harry and Ron.

“What was it like?” said Harry eagerly.

Fred, George, and Lee exchanged looks full of meaning.

“Never had a lesson like it,” said Fred.

“He *knows*, man,” said Lee.

“Knows what?” said Ron, leaning forward.

“Knows what it’s like to be out there *doing* it,” said George impressively. “Doing what?” said Harry.

“Fighting the Dark Arts,” said Fred.

“He’s seen it all,” said George. *(Goblet of Fire 208)*

Ron and Harry eagerly await their first class with Moody and are surprised by the nature of his first lesson: the Unforgivable Curses. During this lesson Harry must witness the curse that killed his parents and Neville witnesses the curse that tortured his parents. Until Moody’s lesson, “Harry knew the details of how his parents had tried to protect him from Voldemort because the Dementors had revealed it to him, but he did not know the exact method of their death” (Eccleshare 57-8). Moody begins his lesson like Lupin informing the students they can put their books away and mentions that Lupin has informed him about their progress the year before (*Goblet of Fire* 210-11). After calling roll, he immediately begins his lesson on the three Unforgivable Curses:

So—straight into it. Curses. They come in many strengths and forms. Now, according to the Ministry of Magic, I’m supposed to teach you countercurse and leave it at that. I’m not supposed to show you what illegal Dark curses look like until you’re in the sixth year. You’re not supposed to be old enough to deal with it till then. But Professor Dumbledore’s got a higher opinion of your nerves, he reckons you can cope, and I say, the sooner you know what you’re up against, the better. How are you supposed to defend yourself against something you’ve never seen? A wizard who’s about to put an illegal curse on you isn’t going to tell you what he’s about to do. He’s not going to be nice and polite to your face. You need to be alert and watchful. (*Goblet of Fire* 211-12)

The first curse Moody demonstrates is the Imperius Curse, in which the master has total control over his or her victim:

The spider leapt from Moody’s hand on a fine thread of silk and began to swing backward and forward as though on a trapeze. It stretched out its legs rigidly, then did a back flip, breaking the thread and landing on the desk, where it began to cartwheel in circles. Moody jerked his wand, and the spider rose onto two of its hind legs and went into what was unmistakably a tap dance. (*Goblet of Fire* 213)

The second curse Moody demonstrates is the Cruciatus Curse, in which the victim is tortured with intense pain:

Moody raised his wand again, pointed it at the spider, and muttered, “*Crucio!*”

At once, the spider’s legs bent in upon its body; it rolled over and began to twitch horribly, rocking from side to side. No sound came from it, but Harry was sure that if it could have given voice, it would have been screaming. Moody did not remove his wand, and the spider started to jerk more violently. (*Goblet of Fire* 214)

Bellatrix Lestrange performed the Cruciatus curse on Neville’s parents, which caused them to be placed in St. Mungo’s Hospital with no hope of recovery. During the lesson, Moody seems to neglect how Neville reacts: “Neville’s hands were clenched upon the desk in front of him, his knuckles white, his eyes wide and horrified” (*Goblet of Fire* 214-15). Hermione intervenes and stops Moody from continuing to torture the spider; Moody presumably takes no notice of Neville’s reaction even though he is aware this Curse was the method used to torture Neville’s parents.

The final curse that Moody demonstrates is the only curse that is fatal and has no countercurse, *Avada Kedavra*, the killing curse:

“Avada Kedavra!” Moody roared.

There was a flash of blinding green light and a rushing sound, as though a vast, invisible something was soaring through the air—instantaneously the spider rolled over onto its back, unmarked, but unmistakably dead. Several of the students stifled cries; Ron had thrown himself backward and almost toppled off his seat as the spider skidded toward him. (*Goblet of Fire* 215-16)

After the attack is over, Moody announces to the class that “there’s no countercurse. There’s no blocking it. Only one known person has ever survived it, and he’s sitting right in front of me” (*Goblet of Fire* 216). Moody’s recognition of Harry as the Boy-Who-Lived only makes Harry more uncomfortable and causes him to recognize “that was how his parents had died...exactly like the spider” (*Goblet of Fire* 216). Moody explains to

the students that he is showing him the curses to teach them “CONSTANT VIGILANCE!” (*Goblet of Fire* 217). Moody’s lesson moves from a demonstration to a note-taking lecture:

“Now...those three curses—Avada Kedavra, Imperius, and Cruciatus—are known as the Unforgivable Curses. The use of any one of them on a fellow human being is enough to earn a life sentence in Azkaban. That’s what you’re up against. That’s what I’ve got to teach you to fight. You need preparing. But most of all, you need practice *constant, never-ceasing vigilance*. Get out your quills...copy this down...”

They spent the rest of the lesson taking notes on each of the Unforgivable Curses. (*Goblet of Fire* 217)

According to Dewey, teachers have "the duty of determining that environment which will interact with the existing capacities and needs of those taught to create a worthwhile experience" (Dewey 340). Although Moody’s lesson is disturbing, it provides the students with an unforgettable experience that illustrates the dangers of the Dark Arts. Other than Lupin, Moody is the only professor who causes the students to experience the Dark Arts firsthand. After the class is over, Moody explains to Harry, Neville, Ron and Hermione why he felt his demonstration was necessary: “You’ve got to know. It seems harsh, maybe, *but you’ve got to know*. No point pretending” (*Goblet of Fire* 219). Moody provides his students with what Dewey would call an “image” of the subject: “[T]he image is the great instrument of instruction. What a child gets out of any subject presented to him is simply the images which he himself forms in regards to it” (Dewey 233). Moody instills a fear of the three Unforgivable Curses inside of the students, a fear that he deems necessary in order for the students to prepare and protect themselves and others from the Dark Arts with constant vigilance. Moody’s seemingly cruel approach actually prepares and informs students about the subject, but it goes against Dewey’s

belief “that only through the continual and sympathetic observation of childhood’s interests can the adult enter into the child’s life and see what it is ready for, and upon what material it could work most readily and fruitfully” (Dewey 223). Moody defies this assertion by introducing an emotionally heavy subject on the first day of class while he simultaneously performs acts Dewey would praise—he engages the students and provides them with experiential education.

As the semester continues Moody’s Defense Against the Dark Arts lessons “becom[e] more difficult and demanding than ever before” (*Goblet of Fire* 230). Moody continues the study of curses, only during this lesson it is the students, not the spiders that suffer. This lesson provides Harry and the other students with firsthand experience at defending themselves against the Imperius Curse, which is often used by Death Eaters:

Moody began to beckon students forward in turn and put the Imperius Curse upon them. Harry watched as, one by one, his classmates did the most extraordinary things under its influence. Dean Thomas hopped three times around the room, singing the national anthem. Lavender Brown imitated a squirrel. Neville performed a series of quite astonishing gymnastics he would certainly not be capable of in his normal state. Not one of them seemed to be able to fight off the curse, and each of them recovered only when Moody had removed it. (*Goblet of Fire* 231)

Moody performs the Imperius Curse on each student, but is most impressed by Harry’s ability to fight against the curse:

Harry moved forward into the middle of the classroom, into the space that Moody had cleared of desks. Moody raised his wand, pointed it at Harry, and said, “*Imperio!*”

It was the most wonderful experience. Harry felt a floating sensation as every thought and worry in his head was wiped gently away, leaving nothing but a vague, untraceable happiness. He stood there feeling immensely relaxed, only dimly aware of everyone watching him.

And then he heard Mad-Eye Moody's voice, echoing in some distant chamber of his empty brain: *Jump onto the desk...jump onto the desk...*

Harry bent his knees obediently, preparing to spring.

Jump onto the desk...

Why, though? Another voice had awoken in the back of his brain. Stupid thing to do, really, said the voice.

Jump onto the desk...

No, I don't think I will, thanks, said the other voice, a little more firmly...no, I don't really want to...

Jump! NOW!

The next thing Harry felt was considerable pain. He had both jumped and tried to prevent himself from jumping—the result was that he'd smashed headlong into the desk, knocking it over, and, by the feeling in his legs, fractured both his kneecaps.

"Now, *that's* more like it!" growled Moody's voice, and suddenly, Harry felt the empty, echoing feeling in his head disappear. He remembered exactly what was happening, and the pain in his knees seemed to double.

"Look at that, you lot...Potter fought! He fought it, and he damn near beat it! We'll try that again, Potter, and the rest of you, pay attention—watch his eyes, that's where you see it—very good, Potter, very good indeed! They'll have trouble controlling *you!*" (*Goblet of Fire* 231-32)

Moody's incorporation of practical lessons in his classroom provides the students with actual experience for fighting against the Dark Arts. Lupin attempts this same approach in his boggarts lesson, but his demonstration seems less disturbing than Moody's. Although Moody has control over the situation, he does not have control over the students' defense mechanisms. Harry hurts himself, falling on the desk while trying to defend himself. In Lupin's classroom, the boggart is incapable of harming the students because the professor always has control over the situation. Moody's progressive method is an excellent example of incorporating personal experience in education, but his execution is questionable—the danger Moody's students face is also related to the fact

that he is possessed by Barty Crouch Jr.¹ Therefore, it is necessary to recognize that Dewey would deem Moody's pedagogy as one that is progressive, while unsafe.

¹ Although I do not discuss the Barty Crouch Jr's use of the Polyjuice Potion to imitate Mad Eye Moody during the time at which he is employed at Hogwarts; I think it is important to note that it is in fact, Barty Crouch Jr—a loyal servant of Lord Voldemort—teaching Defense Against the Dark Arts during this time. Barty Crouch Jr seemingly serves as a strong teacher because he is trying to help Harry reach the Triwizard Cup that will transport him to meet Lord Voldemort at the end of the TriWizard Tournament. I believe this is an important fact in relation to the literary devices and plot of the book, but I am examining the pedagogies of each teacher, not their relationship with Lord Voldemort (with the exception of Quirrell who is possessed by him).

CHAPTER III

GILDEROY LOCKHART

Harry's second Defense Against the Dark Arts professor is the polar opposite of Lupin. Gilderoy Lockhart is characterized as a narcissistic wizard who has famously proclaimed in books and interviews that he has extensive experience with wrestling and defeating creatures of the Dark Arts. His self-centered nature further perpetuates his celebrity status and continues when he moves from adored author to the Defense Against the Dark Arts instructor at Hogwarts. Upon receiving the textbook list at the beginning of the second year, Harry notices seven books written by Lockhart are assigned. Harry's first impression of Lockhart is his encounter with him at the bookstore, Flourish and Blotts:

Gilderoy Lockhart heard him. He looked up. He saw Ron—and then he saw Harry. He stared. Then he leapt to his feet and positively shouted, “It *can't* be Harry Potter?”

The crowd parted, whispering excitedly; Lockhart dived forward, seized Harry's arm, and pulled him to the front. The crowd burst into applause. Harry's face burned as Lockhart shook his hand for the photographer, who was clicking away madly, wafting thick smoke over the Weasleys.

“Nice big smile, Harry,” said Lockhart, through his own gleaming teeth. “Together, you and I are worth the front page.”

When he finally let go of Harry's hand, Harry could hardly feel his fingers. He tried to sidle back over the Weasleys, but Lockhart threw an arm around his shoulders and clamped him tightly to his side.

“Ladies and gentlemen,” he said loudly, waiving for quiet. “What an extraordinary moment this is! The perfect moment for me to make a little announcement I’ve been sitting on for some time!”

“When young Harry here stepped into Flourish and Blotts today, he only wanted to buy my autobiography—which I shall be happy to present him now, free of charge—.” The crowd applauded again. “He had no idea,” Lockhart continued, giving Harry a little shake that made his glasses slip to the end of his nose, “that he would be getting much, much more than my book, *Magical Me*. He and his schoolmates will, in fact, be getting the real magical me. Yes, ladies and gentlemen, I have great pleasure and pride in announcing that this September, I will be taking up the post of Defense Against the Dark Arts teacher at Hogwarts School of Witchcraft and Wizardry!”

The crowd cheered and clapped and Harry found himself presented with the entire works of Gilderoy Lockhart. (*Chamber of Secrets* 60-1)

From their first encounter, Lockhart is immediately attracted to Harry’s own superior fame and reputation. Throughout the semester, he refers to Harry’s superstar status and equates Harry to himself. In Mary Eagleton’s psychological critique of Gilderoy Lockhart and his relationship with Harry and Hermione, “The Danger of Intellectual Masters: Lessons from Harry Potter and Antonia Byatt” Eagleton discusses the tension between Lockhart and Harry: “In a reversal of the usual generational relation it is Harry who has the greatness Lockhart desires. Lockhart doesn’t know whether to identify with it—hence, he orchestrates a photo with Harry and shmoozes up to him—or to undermine it—hence, the frequent putdown comments” (64). Lockhart exploits and humiliates Harry once again when Colin Creevey, a young Gryffindor student, hopes to obtain an autographed picture of Harry. Malfoy exacerbates the situation shouting, “Harry Potter’s giving out signed photos” (*Chamber of Secrets* 97). Lockhart arrives on the scene, wraps his arm around Harry and tells Colin to get a double portrait: “‘Come on then, Mr. Creevey,’ said Lockhart, beaming at Colin. ‘A double portrait, can’t do better than that, and we’ll *both* sign it for you’” (*Chamber of Secrets* 98). Here Lockhart perpetuates

Harry's supposed self-indulgence and spoils Harry by posing as his equal, which could cause Harry's ego to inflate more if he were truly the type of egotistical superstar Lockhart believes him to be. In *The Child and the Curriculum* Dewey discusses the problem of teachers spoiling students: "Interests in reality are but attitudes toward possible experiences; they are not achievements; their worth is in the leverage they afford, not in the accomplishment they represent. To take the phenomena presented at a given age as in any way self-explanatory or self-contained is inevitably to result in indulgence and spoiling" (Dewey 281). Lockhart is guilty of this type of indulgence and spoiling of Harry when he humors Colin and the crowd at the bookstore. During Harry's second year, Lockhart constantly discusses Harry in relation to his own achievements as well. After the student body knows that Harry and Ron flew an illegal car to school and ran it into the Whomping Willow, Lockhart credits Harry's actions to his own relationship with Harry: "'Gave you a taste for publicity didn't I?' said Lockhart. 'Gave you the *bug*. You got onto the front page of the paper with me and you couldn't wait to do it again'" (*Chamber of Secrets* 91). Harry hopes to explain the situation to Lockhart; instead, Lockhart's wall-of-sound approach to conversation cuts off Harry in order for him to present his own theory about Harry's actions. Lockhart simultaneously praises and insults Harry:

"Harry, Harry, Harry," said Lockhart, reaching out and grasping his shoulder. "I *understand*. Natural to want a bit more once you've had the first taste—and I blame myself for giving you that, because it was bound to go to your head—but see here, young man, you can't start *flying cars* to try and get yourself noticed. Just calm down, all right? Plenty of time for all that when you're older. Yes, yes, I know what you're thinking! 'It's all right for him, he's an internationally famous wizard already!' But when I was twelve, I was just as much of a nobody as you are now. In fact, I'd say I was even more of a nobody! I mean, a few people have heard of you, haven't they? All that business with He-Who-Must-Not-Be-

Named!” He glanced at the lightning scar on Harry’s forehead. “I know, I know—it’s not quite as good as winning *Witch Weekly’s* Most-Charming-Smile Award five times in a row, as I have—but it’s a *start*, Harry, it’s a *start*.” (*Chamber of Secrets* 91)

Lockhart’s commentary about Harry’s situation performs the type of spoiling and attention that Dewey discourages, as well as the negative behavior of discouraging a student from his natural talents. His comparison of Harry to himself at twelve equates the two of them and presumes that once Harry reaches Lockhart’s age, attention-seeking behavior will be acceptable. Although Harry does not wish for the type of status Lockhart assumes he does, as a professor Lockhart pushes Harry in this direction without discussing Harry’s desires and aspirations. Interestingly, Lockhart also discourages Harry from celebrity-type behavior. Whether this action is out of the jealousy Eagleton addresses or as advice from a teacher and magical world celebrity; he suggests: “Let me just say that handing out signed pictures at this stage of your career isn’t sensible—looks a tad bigheaded, Harry, to be frank. There may well come a time when, like me, you’ll need to keep a stack handy wherever you go, but”—he gave a little chortle—“I don’t think you’re quite there yet” (*Chamber of Secrets* 98). Lockhart’s constant contradictory behavior does not offer Harry the type of guidance Dewey proposes: “Guidance is not external imposition. *It is freeing the life-process for its own most adequate fulfillment*” (Dewey 281). In other words, Lockhart does not provide Harry with his own individual tools to develop; instead, he assumes a paternal role that will stunt Harry’s growth as a student because of his disregard for Harry’s individual passions, interests, and inclinations.

Unfortunately, Harry is not the only student whose interests are overlooked. Lockhart's classroom fails to educate students in Defense Against the Dark Arts; instead his classroom becomes a space that educates the students about the subject where Lockhart's expertise actually lies—Gilderoy Lockhart. "By the end of the story...the sham of Lockhart's authority is revealed; his monstrous egotism is merely a desperate strategy to hide his lack" (Eagleton 64). It is Harry, Hermione, and Ron who discover that Lockhart's supposed achievements are lies:

"So you've just been taking credit for what a load of other people have done?" said Harry incredulously.

"Harry, Harry," said Lockhart, shaking his head impatiently, "it's not nearly as simple as that. There was work involved. I had to track these people down. Ask them exactly how they managed to do what they did. Then I had to put a Memory Charm on them so they wouldn't remember doing it. If there's one thing I pride myself on, it's my Memory Charms. No, it's been a lot of work, Harry. It's not all book signings and publicity photos, you know. You want fame, you have to be prepared for a long hard slog." (*Chamber of Secrets* 297-8)

Lockhart's own inexperience transfers into the classroom, where it causes his students to study him, rather than the subject he is supposed to teach. The first exam given is over Lockhart's biographical information:

1. *What is Gilderoy Lockhart's favorite color?*
2. *What is Gilderoy Lockhart's secret ambition?*
3. *What, in your opinion, is Gilderoy Lockhart's greatest achievement to date?*

(*Chamber of Secrets* 100)

Lockhart's test contains fifty-four questions about himself, which promotes memorization of useless information. In no way do the first three questions or the 54th—*When is Gilderoy Lockhart's birthday, and what would his ideal gift be?*—relate to the lesson Lockhart has prepared to teach the first day (*Chamber of Secrets* 100). Nor does Lockhart

give any instruction about how to handle Cornish Pixies, the first creature Lockhart dares to release in his classroom. He simply releases the pixies from their cages and exclaims, “Let’s see what you make of them!” (*Chamber of Secrets* 102). Lockhart does not have control over his classroom or the material he has released: “It was pandemonium” (*Chamber of Secrets* 102). Lockhart rushes out of the classroom, leaving Hermione, Ron and Harry to deal with the pixies; this causes Harry and Ron to immediately question his authority:

“Can you *believe* him?” roared Ron as one of the remaining pixies bit him painfully on the ear.

“He just wants to give us some hands-on experience,” said Hermione, immobilizing two pixies at once with a clever Freezing Charm and stuffing them back into their cage.

“*Hands on?*” said Harry, who was trying to grab a pixie dancing out of reach with its tongue out. “Hermione, he didn’t have a clue what he was doing—”

“Rubbish,” said Hermione. “You’ve read his books—look at all those amazing things he’s done—”

“He *says* he’s done,” Ron muttered. (*Chamber of Secrets* 103)

This type of unknowledgeable professor leads to lessons that cause the child’s interest to become mere “excitation; it means playing with a power so as continually to stir it up without directing it toward a definite achievement” (Dewey 281). Lockhart’s lesson, both the test over his biographical information and the release of the pixies without a prepared solution, illustrates the type of instruction that is merely a display of excitement for the subject that lacks direction and achievement. After the unsuccessful lesson with the pixies, Lockhart avoids bringing live creatures to class and transforms his class into a period that reenacts his adventures with story-time lessons where “he read passages from

his books to them” (*Chamber of Secrets* 161). Lockhart assigns homework that does not relate to The Defense Against the Dark Arts: “Homework—compose a poem about my defeat of the Wagga Wagga Werewolf! Signed copies of *Magical Me* to the author of the best one!” (*Chamber of Secrets* 162). Lockhart lacks the knowledge of a qualified teacher and simply uses the classroom to exercise his authority and reassure himself that he is a celebrity.

Although Lockhart demonstrates all of these negative qualities within his classroom, the hands-on experience Hermione mentions above is a quality of teaching that Lockhart hopes to impart when he creates the Dueling Club. Snape and Lockhart select Malfoy (Harry’s arch-nemesis at school) and Harry to participate in a duel against one another. First, the two professors demonstrate the basic strategy of a duel: “Lockhart and Snape turned to face each other and bowed; at least, Lockhart did, with much twirling of his hands, whereas Snape jerked his head irritably. Then they raised their wands like swords in front of them” (*Chamber of Secrets* 190). Although the two illustrate a polite duel—not the type of duel Harry might find himself in with a Death Eater—their display asserts the importance of practicing with someone else and that first-hand experience transfers into real-life application. Furthermore, Snape’s decision to pair Harry with Malfoy gives both students an opportunity to practice defensive and disarming spells against a person they truly loathe. Lockhart’s lack of authority proves to be problematic when the pairs first duel with one another; Malfoy hits Harry with a spell that makes him dance and Harry attacks Malfoy with a tickling spell. Lockhart shouts, “I said disarm only!” and the lesson changes from the two students demonstrating their individual knowledge to both receiving instruction from Snape and Lockhart (*Chamber*

of *Secrets* 192-93). After this disaster, Lockhart suggests that he teach the students “how to block unfriendly spells” (*Chamber of Secrets* 193). Snape suggests that Harry and Malfoy serve as an example:

“Excellent idea!” said Lockhart, gesturing Harry and Malfoy in to the middle of the hall as the crowd backed away to give them room.

“Now, Harry,” said Lockhart. “When Draco points his wand at you, you do this.”

He raised his own wand, attempted a complicated sort of wiggling action, and dropped it. Snape smirked as Lockhart quickly picked it up, saying, “Whoops—my wand is a little overexcited—”

Snape moved closer to Malfoy, bent down, and whispered something in his ear. Malfoy smirked, too. Harry looked up nervously at Lockhart and said, “Professor, could you show me that blocking thing again?”

“Scared?” muttered Malfoy, so that Lockhart couldn’t hear him.

“You wish,” said Harry out of the corner of his mouth.

Lockhart cuffed Harry merrily on the shoulder. “Just do what I did, Harry!”

“What drop my wand?”

But Lockhart wasn’t listening. (*Chamber of Secrets* 193-4)

This lesson shows Lockhart’s inability to either instruct or listen to students. Harry is unprepared for the duel because of Lockhart’s inefficiency as a teacher. Harry is unable to block a spell because Lockhart did not provide Harry with the necessary tools during his demonstration. Therefore, Harry must resort to his own instinct. Dewey comments on the importance of the preparedness of a student for a lesson: “If the subject-matter of the lessons be such as to have an appropriate place within the expanding consciousness of the child, if it grows out of his own past doings, thinkings, and sufferings, and grows into

application in further achievement and receptivities, then no device or trick of method has to be resorted to in order to enlist “interest” (Dewey 286). Interestingly, Lockhart’s lesson illustrates both the strengths and weaknesses of both himself and Snape as teachers. Snape’s insight and suggestion of Harry and Malfoy battling illustrates both Snape’s ability to select students based on their “receptivities” and his downfall as a teacher—his dislike for Harry and tendency to show favoritism to Slytherin students, especially Malfoy. Lockhart, on the other hand, creates an organization that does not require a “device or trick of method” to “enlist interest.” It is a group that has practical application—much like Dumbledore’s Army does later in the series—and *should* allow students to grow as wizards. In Harry’s case specifically, he “grows out of his own past doings” because Lockhart places him a position to act individually, rather than relying on instruction (Dewey 286). Harry resorts to what is natural after Malfoy unleashes a black snake out of the end of his wand:

Harry wasn’t sure what made him do it. He wasn’t even aware of deciding to do it. All he knew was that his legs were carrying him forward as though he was on casters and that he had shouted stupidly at the snake, “Leave him alone!” And miraculously—inexplicably—the snake slumped to the floor, docile as a thick, black garden hose, its eyes now on Harry. Harry felt the fear drain out of him. He knew the snake wouldn’t attack anyone now, though how he knew it, he couldn’t have explained. (*Chamber of Secrets* 194).

Harry’s actions recall the zoo episode where he releases a snake from its cage while visiting a zoo with the Dursleys.

Overall, Lockhart is a poor teacher who relies on traditional methods of education within his classroom. His own inexperience and insecurity also causes weakness in his pedagogy. Lockhart possesses progressive thought, but does not know

how to implement or direct these methods. Although Lockhart's incapability as a teacher leads Harry to discover that he is a parseltongue, Lockhart restricts Harry from growing as a student during the lesson because he is unable to instruct Harry how to perform a disarming charm or create a relevant educational lesson in his Defense Against the Dark Arts class.

CHAPTER IV

QUIRINUS QUIRRELL

The first Defense Against the Dark Arts instructor Harry takes lessons from is an incredibly nervous teacher named Quirinus Quirrell. Harry first encounters Professor Quirrell at the Leaky Cauldron when Hagrid takes him on his first outing to Diagon Alley (*Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone* 69-71). Unlike the Defense Against the Dark Arts professors Harry encounters later in his educational career, Quirrell is controlled by Lord Voldemort himself, which accounts for his nervous nature throughout the novel:

“Professor Quirrell!” said Hagrid. “Harry, Professor Quirrell will be one of your teachers at Hogwarts.”

“P-P-Potter,” stammered Professor Quirrell, grasping Harry’s hand, “c-can’t tell you how p-pleased I am to meet you.”

“What sort of magic do you teach, Professor Quirrell?”

“D-Defense Against the D-D-Dark Arts,” muttered Professor Quirrell, as though he’d rather not think about it. “N-not that you n-need it, eh, P-P-Potter?” He laughed nervously. “You’ll be g-getting all your equipment, I suppose? I’ve g-got to p-pick up a new b-book on vampires, m-myself.” He looked terrified at the very thought. (*Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone* 70)

This first meeting shows that Quirrell knows about Harry’s past with Voldemort and his joke about the unnecessary nature of Harry taking Defense Against the Dark Arts lessons recognizes Harry’s innate ability to defeat Lord Voldemort. This statement confirms what Hagrid has been trying to assert to Harry since the moment Quirrell and Harry met:

“Told yeh, didn’t I?” Told yeh you was famous. Even Professor Quirrell was tremblin’ ter meet yeh—mind you, he’s usually tremblin’.”

“Is he always that nervous?”

“Oh, yeah. Poor bloke. Brilliant mind. He was fine while he was studyin’ outta books but then he took a year off ter get some first-hand experience... They say he met vampires in the Black Forest, and there was a nasty bit o’ trouble with a hag—never been the same since. Scared of the students, scared of his own subject...” (*Harry Potter and the Sorcerer’s Stone* 70-1)

Here, Rowling’s skepticism about merely theoretical knowledge is illustrated. Quirrell’s “studyin’ outta books” does not equip him for his encounter with vampires in the real world. According to Hagrid’s story, Quirrell’s unpreparedness has caused his credibility and intelligence to dissolve because he is “scared of his own subject.” Thus, Rowling asserts Dewey’s belief that the acquisition of knowledge through books alone does not prepare one for the real world; the application and practice of theory is necessary. Dewey declares that “the fundamental unity of the newer philosophy is found in the idea that there is an intimate and necessary relation between the processes of actual experience and education. If this be true, then a positive and constructive development of its own basic idea depends upon having a correct idea of experience” (Dewey 328). In Dewey’s opinion, the belief that textbook education translates to experience is mis-educative and “has the effect of arresting or distorting the growth of further experience” (Dewey 330). Quirrell’s qualification to teach Defense Against the Dark Arts is seemingly his first-hand experience against the Dark Arts, but Hagrid’s tale proves his experience with the Dark Arts is purely theoretical.

Throughout the novel, Harry is told that Snape dislikes Quirrell because he desires the Defense Against the Dark Arts position; Harry, Ron and Hermione suspect that Snape is the evil professor behind all of the negative things happening at Hogwarts.

Quirrell becomes a joke to the students, even Harry, at the beginning of the semester.

Harry's first class with Quirrell is described as a disappointment:

The class everyone had really been looking forward to was Defense Against the Dark Arts, but Quirrell's lesson turned out to be a bit of a joke. His classroom smelled strongly of garlic, which everyone said was to ward off a vampire he'd met in Romania and was afraid would be coming back to get him one of these days. His turban, he told them, had been given to him by an African prince as a thank-you for getting rid of a troublesome zombie, but they weren't sure they believed this story. For one thing, when Seamus Finnigan asked eagerly to hear how Quirrell had fought off the zombie, Quirrell went pink and started talking about the weather; for another, they had noticed that a funny smell hung around the turban, and the Weasley twins insisted that it was stuffed full of garlic as well, so that Quirrell was protected wherever he was. (*Sorcerer's Stone* 134)

The lack of respect the students have for Quirrell continues throughout *Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone*: "The lake froze solid and the Weasley twins were punished for bewitching several snowballs, so that they followed Quirrell around, bouncing off the back of his turban" (194). Quirrell's inability to manage students transfers into his classroom:

The next morning in Defense Against the Dark Arts, while copying down different ways of treating werewolf bites, Harry and Ron were still discussing what they'd do with a Sorcerer's Stone if they had one. It wasn't until Ron said he'd buy his own Quidditch team that Harry remembered about Snape and the coming match. (*Sorcerer's Stone* 220)

Ron and Harry are both uninterested in Quirrell's lesson and able to converse in class while doing work. Quirrell's lesson does not involve peer-interaction or lecture-based learning; instead, the students are instructed to copy notes from a textbook. This type of lesson is one that the student is able to perform thoughtlessly; it does not promote collaborative or experiential learning, it simply asks the child to copy factual information without applying or psychologizing it.

CHAPTER V

DOLORES UMBRIDGE: A NEGATIVE EXAMPLE

Harry first encounters his fifth Defense Against the Dark Arts professor prior to the start of classes. It is important to discuss Umbridge and Harry's interaction from their first meeting which occurs outside of school because it illustrates the problematic nature of the Ministry of Magic directing Hogwarts. Umbridge's pedagogy is a return to what Dewey deems traditional education. Before Harry is subjected to Umbridge's terrible lessons, he is threatened by his new professor during a trial that determines whether or not Harry will return to Hogwarts after using his Patronus to attack two dementors in the Muggle world. Harry is asked to report for a trial before the Ministry of Magic to determine whether he will be permitted to return to Hogwarts after having used his Patronus to attack two dementors in the Muggle world or have his wand confiscated and destroyed. Throughout the series, critics often note that the Ministry of Magic serves as an outlet for Rowling's own political commentary. Aside from the relation between Rowling's own world to the fictional one she creates, the Ministry of Magic provides Harry's world with regimented hegemonic political constructs that have the power to interfere and instruct at Hogwarts.¹ These problematic constructs become evident in *Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix* when Cornelius Fudge, the Minister of Magic,

The Ministry of Magic encourages Umbridge to use (what Paulo Freire deems) a "banking" method of education, in which the student becomes oppressed by the teacher's enforcement of their professional authority. The "banking" method promotes passivity and docility, which relates to Dewey's critique of education. See Chapter 2 of Freire's *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* for further information.

assigns Dolores Umbridge to observe and instruct Defense Against the Dark Arts at Hogwarts. During the trial, Umbridge accuses Dumbledore of “suggesting that the Ministry of Magic had ordered an attack” on Harry (*Order of the Phoenix* 146-7). Ironically, Dumbledore’s assumption is true; Harry later finds out the attack was issued by Umbridge herself. Umbridge’s intervention in the political turmoil between Dumbledore and Fudge, the Minister of Magic, and her disbelief in Harry’s encounter with Voldemort illustrates her allegiance to the Ministry of Magic, which immediately causes Harry to distrust her.

After Harry is cleared of all charges, he returns to The Order of the Phoenix headquarters, and receives the textbook list for the upcoming semester. He recognizes two new textbooks: “*The Standard Book of Spells, Grade 5*, by Miranda Goshawk and *Defensive Magical Theory*, by Wilbert Slinkhard” (*Order of the Phoenix* 160). According to George Weasley, these new additions are because “Dumbledore’s found a new Defense Against the Dark Arts teacher” (160). The other Weasley twin informs Harry that “Dumbledore was having real trouble finding anyone to do the job” and Harry recalls what has happened to the last four Defense Against the Dark Arts professors: “One sacked, one dead, one’s memory removed, and one locked in a trunk for nine months” (161). Harry’s assessment of the situation highlights the danger of accepting the Defense Against the Dark Arts position, as well as his close interaction with all four professors during the semesters in which each of the tragedies occurred. Harry witnessed Lupin’s firing, Quirrell’s death, Lockhart’s memory loss, and Mad-Eye Moody’s recovery from the trunk first-hand, a pattern which implies that Harry will also develop a close and problematic relationship with the new professor.

Unfortunately for Harry and all of the other students at Hogwarts, the new Defense Against the Dark Arts professor is Dolores Umbridge. Harry immediately recognizes her during the start-of-term banquet in the Great Hall before the Sorting Hat's song, but unlike Hermione, he does not speculate as to why she might be there (*Order of the Phoenix* 203). After the Sorting Hat sings a rather disturbing song about the danger that lurks at Hogwarts, Dumbledore introduces Umbridge as the new Defense Against the Dark Arts teacher and begins to discuss the rest of the year, but is rudely interrupted by Umbridge who proceeds to make an unnecessary speech (211). Although Dumbledore "only looked taken aback for a moment, then sat back down smartly and looked alertly at Professor Umbridge as though he desired nothing better than to listen to her talk," the other teachers show their surprise at Umbridge's audacity of interrupting the headmaster: "Professor Sprout's eyebrows had disappeared into her flyaway hair, and Professor McGonagall's mouth was as thin as Harry had ever seen it. No new teacher had ever interrupted Dumbledore before. Many of the students were smirking; this woman obviously did not know how things were done at Hogwarts" (211). Dolores Umbridge is immediately disrespected and made into a joke by the students. Parvati whispers, "I'll be her friend as long as I don't have to borrow that cardigan" while the rest of the students "exchanged looks" and "were barely concealing grins" (212). As Umbridge continues to speak, Harry notices that "Professor McGonagall's dark eyebrows had contracted so that she looked positively hawklike, and Harry distinctly [sees] her exchange a significant glance with Professor Sprout" while the "quiet that always filled the Hall when Dumbledore was speaking was breaking up as students put their heads together whispering and giggling" (212-13). Harry's acknowledgment of the attitude of both the

students and teachers toward Umbridge—“Harry had the impression that a full-scale riot could have broken out under her nose”—shows the Hogwarts community’s disapproval of Umbridge (213).

During Umbridge’s speech, Harry notices: “Hermione seemed to be drinking in every word Umbridge spoke, though judging by her expression, they were not at all to her taste” (*Order of the Phoenix* 213). Hermione’s attentiveness proves to be important; unlike Harry and Ron, Hermione finds Umbridge’s speech “illuminating.” It is Hermione who uncovers Umbridge’s purpose at Hogwarts:

“How about ‘progress for progress’ sake must be discouraged? How about ‘pruning wherever we find practices that ought to be prohibited’?”

“Well what does that mean?” said Ron impatiently.

“I’ll tell you what it means,” said Hermione ominously. “It means the Ministry’s interfering at Hogwarts” (214).

Hermione’s recognition of the political subtext within Umbridge’s speech shows Hermione’s ability to discern the political from the educational, a trait that proves effective throughout *Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix*. An ongoing battle between the students and Umbridge exists throughout the novel, so the impression Umbridge makes on the faculty, staff, and students at the beginning-of-the-year banquet sets up a division between Umbridge and the faculty and staff loyal to Dumbledore and Harry:

Many of the students and teachers dislike Umbridge because she is conceited, hateful, and abusive; she denies Voldemort’s existence and stubbornly supports Fudge’s claims; she is rude to Hagrid and the centaurs because they are only partially human; and she causes Harry physical pain when she makes him write lines night after night into his own skin. (Adney 108)

Adney highlights both Umbridge's unpleasant disposition and the division between those who believe Voldemort has returned—Dumbledore, Harry and their supporters—and those who do not believe Voldemort is back—The Ministry of Magic and its supporters. This division proves to be important throughout *Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix* because it illustrates the overlap between politics and education at Hogwarts. The Ministry of Magic's interference with the educational process is an effort to both control the education of the students in relation to the Dark Arts and convince the students and faculty at Hogwarts that Lord Voldemort has not returned.

In Heather Debling's article "'You survived to bear witness': Trauma, Testimony, and the Burden of Witnessing in *Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix*," Debling notes: "Rowling uses the character of Umbridge to show what lengths some people will go to, to suppress information they would rather not hear, to suppress testimony that threatens the stability of their world" (78). Umbridge's pedagogy is a return to what Dewey calls traditional education. Dewey describes traditional education as static, didactic, systematic, and lecture and text-book based. In *My Pedagogic Creed* Dewey asserts:

I believe that much of present education fails because it neglects this fundamental principle of the school as a form of community life. It conceives the school as a place where certain information is to be given, where certain lessons are to be learned, or where certain habits are to be formed. The value of these is conceived as lying largely in the remote future; the child must do these things for the sake of something else he is to do; they are mere preparation. As a result they do not become a part of the life experience of the child and so are not truly educative (Dewey 231).

Dewey rejects education that is only instructive; he promotes student-centered learning, rather than passive teacher-centered lessons. Dewey argues that it is necessary for an

academy to advocate the socialization of students in an educational environment that enables collaborative learning and social activity. The appointment of Dolores Umbridge as the Defense Against the Dark Arts professor and later the High Inquisitor disables this type of active and communal learning.

Unlike the other Defense Against the Dark Arts teachers, Umbridge's classroom is a dictatorship in which the students are subjected to a systematic and static professor who views her students as part of an assembly-line: Umbridge provides them with information, and the students must memorize the information and regurgitate it on their O.W.L. examination. Umbridge does not relate Defense Against the Dark Arts to the real world, instead she presents it as abstract and theoretical. Dolores Umbridge resorts to traditional education that promotes memorization instead of application and text book training, rather than the type of experiential and progressive education that Dewey asserts which relies heavily on experience, peer interaction and the unification of the real world and educational world.

Booth has noted at Hogwarts "teachers generally have free rein within their own classroom regarding teaching methodology and textbook choice" (313). Umbridge and the Ministry of Magic take advantage of this opportunity to choose how to instruct a class and rely on simplistic textbooks on Defense Against the Dark Arts. In "Harry Potter and the Freedom of Information," Flaherty asserts that "Umbridge's Defense Against the Dark Arts class is the antithesis of teaching" (95). Flaherty's assertion is supported by the critical examination of Umbridge's pedagogy in relation to that advocated by John Dewey that follows. Umbridge's reliance upon simplistic textbooks and her method of

teaching exemplifies Dewey's disgust with traditional education; her methodology contains what Dewey calls "three typical evils" (Dewey 285).

1. A lack of connection between experience and formal education causes material to become solely formal and symbolic.
2. A lack of motivation occurs in students when they are supplied material in the form of a lesson that is to be learned as a lesson.
3. Students have trouble grasping material in the form of a lesson because abstract material and the quality of the material is lost when it is presented in an external, ready-made fashion.

These evils are illustrated throughout Umbridge's instruction of Harry's Defense Against the Dark Arts class.

Umbridge begins her first Defense Against the Dark Arts class instructing her students on the proper way to respond to her during class. Upon entering the classroom she addresses the students with a cheerful "Good afternoon," and a few of her students mumble a half hearted reply (*Order of the Phoenix* 239). Umbridge immediately objects to the students' reaction: "'Tut, tut' said Professor Umbridge. '*That* won't do now, will it? I should like you, please, to reply 'Good afternoon, Professor Umbridge.' One more time, please. Good afternoon class!'" (239). Umbridge's students are placed in the submissive role of responder; rather than allowing the students to react in their preferred ways, Umbridge forces them to reply to her in a manner that appeases her. From the beginning, Umbridge's authoritarian method of teaching strips her students of autonomy: "Where the most effective teachers at Hogwarts encourage questions, discussion, and

practice in a secure environment, Umbridge designs a course in which rules are paramount, questions are ignored, and theory is more age-appropriate than practice” (Flaherty 95). Dewey would disagree with the assertion that “theory is more age-appropriate than practice” because he believes: “There is no such thing as educational value in the abstract” (Dewey 341). Umbridge views the child as a being that needs correction, not direction. Dewey discusses this type of instruction: “The child is simply the immature being who is to be matured; he is the superficial being who is to be deepened; his narrow experience is to be widened. It is his to receive, to accept. His part is fulfilled when he is ductile and docile” (Dewey 278). Umbridge’s first lesson further exemplifies Dewey’s problem of the child becoming “ductile and docile” in her first interaction with Hermione.

Professor Umbridge begins her class by outlining her course aims on the blackboard:

1. Understanding the principles underlying defensive magic.
2. Learning to recognize situations in which defensive magic can legally be used.
3. Placing the use of defensive magic in a context for practical use.
(*Order of the Phoenix* 240)

Hermione immediately recognizes “There’s nothing written up there about using defensive spells” (241). Hermione rejects the idea of not using spells in class because she will be tested on the application of spells later that semester during her O.W.L. exam. Umbridge does not provide Hermione and her friends with adequate knowledge of defensive spells, which causes Hermione to dislike her. Her class is “solely lecture-based, where the students are given no chance for practical application” (Adney 108). Many of

the students express concern and hesitation about not practicing the defensive spells in class, but it is Harry who is most upset by this information because he has already encountered situations in the real world where he has applied what he has learned in his Defense Against the Dark Arts classes. Flaherty discusses the need for real-world application:

The difference between tests and the real world is the difference between Harry's simple entertaining Defense Against the Dark Arts exam and his nightmarish encounter with Voldemort's Death Eaters in the Department of Mysteries, which is the actual test of how well the children have mastered defensive magic. While the exams are important when it comes to impressing future employers or determining the proper course of study, Rowling makes a distinct division between the knowledge required to succeed in an exam and the knowledge required to succeed in life. (Flaherty 98)

Umbridge offers the material as textbook information that needs to be memorized in order to pass exams. Defense Against the Dark Arts is presented by Umbridge as completely theoretical. Umbridge supports this idea, saying, “Now it is the view of the Ministry that a theoretical knowledge will be more than sufficient to get you through your examination, which, after all, is what school is all about” (*Order of the Phoenix* 243). According to Dewey, in the purely theoretical model “[l]earning...means acquisition of what is already incorporated in books and in the heads of the elders. Moreover, that which is taught is thought of as essentially static. It is taught as a finished product, with little regard either to the ways in which it was originally built up or to changes that will surely occur in the future” (Dewey 327-8). Dewey objects to such a model because school is not a place to merely learn theory, but a setting where students should be able to apply and experience a subject. Dewey asserts that “the teacher's business is simply to determine on the basis of larger experience and riper wisdom, how the discipline of life

shall come to the child” (Dewey 231). Umbridge’s traditional method of teaching does not provide her students with the “discipline of life”; instead it causes them to become passive and submissive. Dewey discusses this as a problem of traditional education:

Since the subject-matter as well as standards of proper conduct are handed down from the past, the attitude of pupils must, upon the whole, be one of docility, receptivity, and obedience. Books, especially textbooks, are the chief representatives of the lore and wisdom of the past, while teachers are the organs through which pupils are brought in to effective connection with the material. Teachers are the agents through which knowledge and skills are communicated and rules of conduct enforced. (Dewey 327)

Umbridge’s duty is to enforce rules. The O.W.L exams are supposed to provide students with career opportunities and assess how suitable individuals are for each profession.

Dewey discusses this idea maintaining that, “Examinations are of use only so far as they test the child's fitness for social life and reveal the place in which he can be of most service and where he can receive the most help” (Dewey 231). In relation to the O.W.L.s, Dewey’s discussion of examinations supports the idea of examinations aiding students in finding their future passions and pathways in life. Instead of asking the students to learn material in order to prepare for their future, Umbridge asserts that school is a place that prepares you for examinations, rather than an educative place that prepares you for the social world.

Umbridge commits this mistake when she discusses her plans for the upcoming semester and how she intends to instruct her students. She plans to prepare them with textbook and lecture based lessons, which neither the students, nor Dewey, support. In the *Child and the Curriculum* Dewey writes:

Text-book and teacher vie with each other in presenting to the child the subject-matter as stands to the specialist. Such modification and revision as it undergoes

are a mere elimination of certain scientific difficulties, and the general reduction to a lower intellectual level. The material is not translated into life-terms, but is directly offered as a substitute for, or an external annex to, the child's present life. (Dewey 285)

The problem of not translating material into life-terms is present in the theoretical teaching of Defense Against the Dark Arts Umbridge provides. An uproar of questions follows Umbridge's assertion that the Defense Against the Dark Arts theory without application or practice should suffice when the students take their O.W.L.s:

"Now it is the view of the Ministry that a theoretical knowledge will be more than sufficient to get your through your examination, which, after all, is what school is all about. And your name is?" she added, staring at Parvati, whose hand had just shot up.

"Parvati Patil, and isn't there a practical bit in our Defense Against the Dark Arts O.W.L? Aren't we supposed to show that we can actually do the countercurses and things?"

"As long as you have studied the theory hard enough, there is no reason why you should not be able to perform the spells under carefully controlled examination conditions," said Professor Umbridge dismissively.

"Without ever practicing them before?" said Parvati incredulously. "Are you telling us that the first time we'll get to do the spells will be during our exam?"

"I repeat, as long as you have studied the theory long enough---"

"And what good's theory going to be in the real world?" said Harry loudly, his fist in the air again.

Professor Umbridge looked up.

"This is school, Mr. Potter, not the real world" she said softly.

(Order of the Phoenix 244)

Umbridge dismisses her students' concern and asserts that theoretical knowledge is sufficient in a subject that requires practice and application to both pass the O.W.L. exam and use in the real world. Umbridge is promoting the first evil that Dewey describes in

the *Child and the Curriculum*. He writes, “(T)he lack of organic connection with what the child has already seen and felt and loved makes the material purely formal and symbolic....It (a symbol) is not a reality, but just the sign of a reality which *might* be experienced if certain conditions were fulfilled” (Dewey 285). Umbridge’s belief in theory rather than practice causes Defense Against the Dark Arts as a subject to become abstract and symbolic. It is cast aside from the other experiential and collaborative subjects the students study such as herbology and charms, and turned into an uninteresting lesson. For example, Harry and the other students in the classroom are immediately uninterested in Umbridge’s lesson when they are told to put their wands away. “Many of the class exchanged gloomy looks; the order ‘wands away’ had never yet been followed by a lesson they had found interesting” (*Order of the Phoenix* 239).

This type of lecture-based instruction is also seen in another subject at Hogwarts, History of Magic instructed by Professor Binns. Throughout the series, Professor Binns’s History of Magic class is considered the most boring. In *Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix*, Rowling highlights why the students dislike Binns’s lessons:

History of Magic was by common consent the most boring subject ever devised by Wizard-kind. Professor Binns, their ghost teacher, had a wheezy, droning voice that was almost guaranteed to cause severe drowsiness within ten minutes, five in warm weather. He never varied the form of their lessons, but lectured them without pausing while they took notes, or rather, gazed sleepily into space. Harry and Ron had so far managed to scrape passes in this subject only by copying Hermione’s notes before exams; she alone seemed able to resist the soporific power of Binns’s voice. (228-29)

Binns’s inability to present History of Magic in a manner that does not require him to lecture with his “wheezy, droning voice” causes the students to become disengaged and ineffectively study for his exams. Binns’s lessons become a practice at the art of memorization for Harry and Ron when they proceed to copy Hermione’s notes. The

problematic nature of Binns's instruction is also seen when Harry takes his O.W.L. over History of Magic. He tries to memorize information before the exam, illustrating his pattern of cramming to pass History of Magic exams. "Their final exam, History of Magic, was not to take place until that afternoon...trying hard not to doze off as he read through some of the notes stacked three-and-a-half feet high that Hermione had lent him" (*Order of the Phoenix* 724). When Harry receives his exam, he immediately struggles with the questions asked. He is unsure about names, places, dates and events, and has to skip question four and felt he "had a nagging suspicion that he had missed several important points" on the questions he does answer (725). During his examination, Harry becomes so uninterested in the subject that Voldemort is able to enter his mind, causing him to be unable to concentrate on his test and luring him into the chaotic trap that occurs at the end of the novel. In *Harry Potter and the Half-Blood Prince*, Harry receives his O.W.L. scores. He earns his lowest grade—D, which stands for Dreadful—on the History of Magic section of the examination.

The correlation between lecture-based subjects and uninterested students relates to Dewey's second evil, an evil that both Umbridge and Binns are guilty of committing: "The second evil in this external presentation is lack of motivation...(W)hen material is directly supplied in the form of a lesson to be learned as a lesson, the connecting links of need and aim are conspicuous for their absence" (Dewey 285). Returning now to Umbridge's classroom, the students' apprehension about Umbridge's *theoretical knowledge is equal to practical application* theory highlights two different types of concerns that occur: educational and real world application and consequences. Parvati's concern lies within the educational world, she hopes to pass her O.W.L. examination;

whereas Harry's frustration is with the impractical nature of learning the theory of the Dark Arts, when the application of it is what proves to be useful in the real world.

Umbridge's authoritarian approach to teaching causes her students to become dismissive of the education she presents them with. Again, this is seen with teachers whose lectures do not provide the students with the ability to both exercise their intellect and apply their thoughts and practices in the classroom. Unlike Lupin, Umbridge does not motivate her students to learn a lesson because it is practical, but simply because it is to be learned in order to pass her class. Umbridge is not concerned with the application of the Defense Against the Dark Arts, causing her to instruct her students to simply read their textbook in class. This type of classroom setting illustrates Dewey's final evil:

The third evil is that even the most scientific matter, arranged in most logical fashion, loses this quality, when presented in external, ready-made fashion, by the time it gets to the child...the child's reasoning powers, the faculty of abstraction and generalization, are not adequately developed. So the subject-matter is evacuated of its logical value, and, though it is what it is only from the logical standpoint, is presented as stuff only for "memory" (Dewey 286)

Hermione challenges Umbridge's pedagogy because she does not believe Defense Against the Dark Arts is merely stuff for memory, nor does she feel that she is learning anything in a classroom by reading the book:

I am here to teach you a Ministry-approved method that does not include inviting students to give their opinions on matters about which they understand very little. Your previous teachers in this subject may have allowed you more license, but as none of them—with the possible exception of Professor Quirrell, who did at least appear to have restricted himself to age-appropriate subjects—would have passed the Ministry inspection. (*Order of the Phoenix* 317).

Umbridge rejects Hermione's attempt to criticize the perspective that Slinkhard presents in the assigned textbook and undermines Hermione, claiming that her opinion is not of value because it is about something students seem to "understand very little" (317).

Umbridge asks the students to merely read and memorize the textbook, something Hermione has already done in her free time: “I’ve read the whole book” (316). Hermione illustrates a student attempting to have a deeper understanding of the practice and theory, but Umbridge causes the Defense of the Dark Arts to be “evacuated of its logical value” and become “essentially static. It is taught as a finished product, with little regard either to the ways in which it was originally built up or to changes that will surely occur in the future” (Dewey 321-22). She does not allow the subject-matter to advance or become psychologized by Hermione; in Umbridge’s classroom “Learning...means acquisition of what already is incorporated in books and in the heads of the elders” (Dewey 321). Therefore, Umbridge’s classroom does not promote experiential learning or students with the ability to internalize and challenge traditional material. Her classroom causes a stultification in progressive thinking and places the students in an ineffective environment where they become dismissive of a subject that is applicable, not only in the educational world, but in real life situations.

CHAPTER VI

DEALING WITH THE DISCIPLINARIAN:

HARRY'S DETENTIONS WITH DOLORES UMBRIDGE

The most despicable act that Umbridge commits as a teacher is not her thoughtless lessons; it is when she assumes the role of disciplinarian. Throughout the series Harry serves a number of detentions with various professors, but his detention with Umbridge is unlike any other. Harry is assigned detention for discussing his witnessing of Cedric Diggory's death and the return of Lord Voldemort in the middle of Umbridge's class. Umbridge does not believe Harry's story—again, she sides with the Ministry of Magic and believes Voldemort has not returned—so she feels that Harry is being insubordinate and challenging her authority. When Harry arrives in Umbridge's office to serve his detention, he first asks her if he can change the date of his detention in order to participate in a Quidditch practice. She replies:

“Oh no, no, no. This is your punishment for spreading evil, nasty, attention-seeking stories, Mr. Potter, and punishments certainly cannot be adjusted to suit one's guilty convenience. No, you will come here at five o'clock tomorrow, and the next day, and on Friday too, and you will do your detentions as planned. I think it is a rather good thing that you are missing something you really want to do. It ought to reinforce the lesson I am trying to teach you.” (*Order of the Phoenix* 265-66).

Her rejection of Harry's appeal illustrates her firm belief in punishment as a consequence. She then informs Harry that he will be writing lines and will not need to use his quill; instead she will provide him with one of her own (266). Dewey discusses punishment as

a method of contrast-effects: “[T]he material of the lesson is rendered interesting, if not in itself, at least in contrast with some alternative experience. To learn the lesson is more interesting than to take a scolding, be held up to general ridicule, stay after school, receive degradingly low marks, or fail to be promoted” (Dewey 287).

Umbridge is trying to force Harry into the role that Harry forced the serpent into when he spoke parseltongue during his duel with Malfoy during Lockhart’s Dueling Club experiment in *Harry Potter and the Chamber of Secrets*. The snake obeys Harry when Harry yells at it to “Leave him alone!” (*Chamber of Secrets* 194). The snake’s reaction to Harry can be read as parallel to the role a student is supposed to take when traditionally educated. The student is simply supposed to listen to instruction and become docile and obedient. The snake retreats because it is told to and is described as being “docile”; Umbridge hopes Harry will believe and act as she tells him to. Umbridge’s method of punishment is one of violence that is meant to instill fear in Harry:

I must not tell lies.

I must not tell lies.

The parchment was now shining with drops of blood from the back of his hand, which was searing with pain. When he next looked up, night had fallen and the Quidditch pitch was no longer visible.

“Let’s see if you’ve gotten the message yet, shall we?” said Umbridge’s soft voice half an hour later.

She moved toward him, stretching out her short be-ringed fingers for his arm. And then, as she took hold of him to examine the words now cut into his skin, pain seared, not across the back of his hand, but across the scar on his forehead. At the same time, he had a most peculiar sensation somewhere around his midriff.

He wrenched his arm out of her grip and leapt to his feet, staring at her. She looked back at him, a smile stretching her wide, slack mouth.

“Yes, it hurts doesn’t it?” she said softly. (*Order of the Phoenix* 275)

The painful nature of Harry’s punishment pleases Umbridge because she believes it will bring about order in her classroom. If Harry does not speak out against her or the Ministry of Magic in Defense Against the Dark Arts students will assume they are receiving an adequate education from the textbook and do not need to practice defensive spells to use against the dangers outside of the school. Umbridge’s disciplinary method enforces order and subordination. Dewey discusses punishment in relation to instilling interest in the student: “[V]ery much of what goes by the name of ‘discipline,’ prides itself upon opposing the doctrines of a soft pedagogy and upon upholding the banner of effort and duty, is nothing more or less than just this appeal to ‘interest’ in its obverse aspect—to fear, to dislike the various kinds of physical, social and personal pain” (Dewey 287).

Umbridge further complicates the role of the disciplinarian by showing her pleasure when Harry feels pain:

Harry placed the point of the quill on the paper and wrote: I must not tell lies.

He let out a gasp of pain. The words had appeared on the parchment in what appeared to be shining red ink. At the same time, the words had appeared on the back of Harry’s right hand, cut into his skin as though traced there by a scalpel—yet even as he stared at the shining cut, the skin healed over again, leaving the place where it had been slightly redder than before but quite smooth.

Harry looked around at Umbridge. She was watching him, her wide, toadlike mouth stretched into a smile.

“Yes?”

“Nothing,” said Harry quietly.

He looked back at the parchment, placed the quill upon it once more, wrote I must not tell lies, and felt the searing pain on the back of his hand for a second time; once again the words had been cut into his skin, once again they healed over seconds later.

And on it went. Again and again Harry wrote the words on his parchment in what he soon came to realize was not ink, but his own blood. And again and again the words were cut into the back of his hand, healed, and then reappeared the next time he set quill to parchment. (*Order of the Phoenix* 266-67)

Umbridge’s method of punishment perpetuates the anger Harry feels toward her.

Hermione and Ron discover the scars on Harry’s hand, causing both of them to see the serious nature of Umbridge’s hatred for Harry and her denial of experiential education. It is after Harry’s detentions that Hermione suggests the students need to learn Defense Against the Dark Arts from someone else; Hermione and Harry retaliate against all that Umbridge stands for—discipline, the Ministry of Magic, lecture-based and textbook learning, traditional education—by forming Dumbledore’s Army.

CHAPTER VII

DUMBLEDORE'S ARMY: POTTER'S PEDAGOGY

When Hermione, Ron and Harry discuss establishing Dumbledore's Army, Hermione points out that the students have "gone past the stage where we can just learn things out of books" (*Order of the Phoenix* 325). Hermione recognizes the necessity of practical lessons when studying Defense Against the Dark Arts: "We need a teacher, a proper one, who can show us how to use the spells and correct us if we're going wrong" (325). The position of teacher gives Harry the authority to direct and evaluate his peers, which encourages peer interaction, constructive criticism, and collaborative learning. Hermione even belittles tests when explaining how vital a proper teacher is: "You [Harry] beat me in our third year—the only year we both sat the test and had a teacher who actually knew something about the subject. But I'm not talking about test results, Harry. Look what you've *done!*" (326). Hermione believes that Harry's experience qualifies him to become the leader of Dumbledore's Army. Ron proceeds to discuss Harry's qualifications and achievements: "First year—you saved the Stone from You-Know-Who...Second year...you killed the basilisk and destroyed Riddle...Third year...you fought off about a hundred dementors at once...Last year...you fought off You-Know-Who again..." (236-67). Harry's past encounters with Voldemort and the Dark Arts provide him with personal experience that none of the other students at Hogwarts have.

In an upset state Harry explains the tribulations he has encountered in his interaction with Voldemort:

You don't know what it's like! You—neither of you—you've never had to face him, have you? You think it's just memorizing a bunch of spells and throwing them at him, like you're in class or something? The whole time you know there's nothing between you and dying except your own—your own brain or guts or whatever—like you can think straight when you know you're about a second from being murdered, or tortured, or watching your friends die—they've never taught us that in their classes, what it's like to deal with things like that—and you two sit there acting like I'm a clever little boy to be standing here, alive, like Diggory was stupid, like he messed up—you just don't get it, that could just as easily have been me, it would have been if Voldemort hadn't needed me. (*Order of the Phoenix* 326-67)

Harry's outburst and recollection of tragic memories relates to Dewey's theory that there are two aspects of experience: "There is an immediate aspect of agreeableness or disagreeableness, and there is its influence upon later experiences" (Dewey 331).

Hermione recognizes that Harry's experience will play a positive role in his ability to train other students: "'Harry' she said timidly, 'don't you see? This...this is exactly why we need you... We need to know what it's r-really like...facing him...facing V-Voldemort'" (*Order of the Phoenix* 327). Harry's firsthand experience enables him to facilitate an agreeable setting for his peers to learn about what defense mechanisms are useful when fighting the Dark Arts. Dewey addresses the problematic role of incorporating personal experience within the classroom:

[B]asing education upon personal experience may mean more multiplied and more intimate contacts between the mature and the immature than ever existed in the traditional school, and consequently more, rather than less, guidance by others. The problem then, is: how these contacts can be established without violating the principle of learning through personal experience. The solution of this problem requires a well thought-out philosophy of the social factors that operate in the constitution of individual experience. (Dewey 329)

As a teacher, Harry overcomes Dewey's assumption that basing education on personal experience is problematic. Harry uses his own experiences to formulate his lessons. Harry understands that "(e)verything depends on the *quality* of experience which is had" (Dewey 331). Therefore, Harry must formulate a "well thought-out philosophy" in order to present the members of Dumbledore's Army with valuable lessons that both grow out of his experience and will become their own: "Sometimes it [Dumbledore's Army] seemed an insane idea, just as it had on the night Hermione had proposed it, but at others, he had found himself thinking about the spells that had served him best in his various encounters with Dark creatures and Death Eaters—found himself, in fact, subconsciously planning lessons..." (*Order of the Phoenix* 331). Harry's lesson planning supports Dewey's assertion: "Just because traditional education was a matter of routine in which the plans and programs were handed down from the past, it does not follow that progressive education is a matter of planless improvisation" (Dewey 332). Harry's excitement about forming Dumbledore's Army is shown in his lesson planning and psychologizing of the material and is furthered when Sirius supports Harry's plan and points out the practicality of the students training themselves: "This year we know that there's someone outside Hogwarts who'd like to kill us all, so I think learning to defend yourselves properly is a very good idea!" (*Order of the Phoenix* 371).

Furthermore, Dumbledore's Army is a direct revolt against Umbridge and traditional education: "Hermione combats Umbridge and actively pursues knowledge by starting the Defense Against the Dark Arts club, which she states is more important than homework (*Order of the Phoenix* 325). Her rationalization for the club directly refutes Umbridge's course goals: "It's about preparing ourselves, like Harry said in Umbridge's

first lesson, for what's waiting out there. It's about making sure we really can defend ourselves" (Adney 109). The members of Dumbledore's Army's commitment to education is further shown when the group continues to meet after Umbridge has become the High Inquisitor of Hogwarts and posts another educational decree: "Any student organization found to have formed, or to belong to, an Organization, Society, Team, Group, or Club that has not been approved by the High Inquisitor will be expelled" (*Order of the Phoenix* 352). Dewey believes "The most important attitude that can be formed is that of desire to go on learning"; hence, the student's desire to continue their study after the decree illustrates the adoption of such an attitude (Dewey 342). This decree motivates Harry and the other members of Dumbledore's Army to continue to meet for educational purposes in order to battle the Ministry of Magic and Umbridge's ignorance.

The formation of Dumbledore's Army promotes peer interaction and collaborative learning. As the head of the classroom, Harry's lessons are practical and promote experiential education. This is partially due to the education Harry has received at Hogwarts, especially from Lupin, Sprout, McGonagall, and Flitwick. Lessons at Hogwarts are often the source of vital information which Harry and his friends use during their real world adventures. A combination of two critics' perspectives on the education given to students by the Defense Against the Dark Arts professors at Hogwarts catalogues the type of preparation Harry receives inside and outside of the classroom while at Hogwarts:

Harry's increasing magical powers come from his education. The spells he learns in different lessons equip him to resist Voldemort. In *Harry Potter and the Prisoner of Azkaban* he is painstakingly taught the Patronus Charm by Professor

Lupin, even though it is a magic well beyond his years, because he needs to know how to protect himself against the Dementors; learning the Summoning Charm—the trick of getting what you want to fly into your hand—takes a lot of practice with books, quills, and upturned chairs and finally succeeds with a dictionary, but it more than pays off when Harry summons his Firebolt to him in the first task of the Triwizard Tournament in *Harry Potter and the Goblet of Fire*, let alone when it saves his life by allowing him to escape from Voldemort. (Eccleshare 94)

Heilman also discusses the preparation Harry receives within the classroom:

Of all his classes, the Defense Against the Dark Arts classes help Harry the most in his heroic quest. In *Prisoner of Azkaban*, Remus Lupin's lesson in confronting one's own fears (in the form of the Boggart) is a true life learning lesson (132-140), and the lessons about animagi, magicians who can transform themselves into animals, prove especially important for Harry's education (108). In *Goblet of Fire*, Mad-Eye Moody gives lessons on resisting the most deadly curses, including one that killed Harry's parents. (Heilman 216)

These critics (and many others) discuss the evolution of Harry as a student, but fail to explore his capacity as a teacher. Harry moves from student to master without difficulty in order to assemble Dumbledore's Army. Dewey discusses the role of the ideal teacher:

As a teacher he is not concerned with adding new facts to the science he teaches; in propounding new hypotheses or in verifying them. He is concerned with the subject-matter of the science as *representing a given stage and phase of the development of experience*. His problem is that of inducing a vital and personal experiencing. Hence, what concerns him, as teacher, is the ways in which that subject may become a part of experience; what there is in the child's present that is usable with reference to it; how such elements are to be used; how his own knowledge of the subject-matter may assist in interpreting the child's needs and doings, and determine the medium in which the child should be placed in order that his growth may be properly directed. He is concerned, not with the subject-matter as such, but with the subject-matter as a related factor in a total and growing experience. (Dewey 284)

During the Dumbledore's Army meetings, Harry's pedagogy illustrates Dewey's philosophy of collaborative and experiential teaching and learning. Harry marries his experience with the knowledge he and his peers have learned in their Defense Against the

Dark Arts class in order to provide Dumbledore's Army with a progressive and well-directed study.

Harry begins the first meeting of Dumbledore's Army practicing the disarming charm; a charm that is considered elementary, but that Harry feels is a necessary starting point: "I was thinking, the first thing we should do is *Expelliarmus*, you know, the Disarming Charm. I know it's pretty basic but I've found it really useful—" (*Order of the Phoenix* 392). Zacharias Smith objects to his lesson from the beginning, arguing, "I don't think *Expelliarmus* is exactly going to help us against You-Know-Who, do you?" (*Order of the Phoenix* 392). Harry refutes Smith's claim, relying on his personal experience as evidence for the importance of mastering *Expelliarmus*, "I've used it against him...It saved my life last year" (392). Harry's ability to relate the lesson to his personal experience and remind the group of Voldemort's presence shows Harry's capability as a teacher; this ability relates to Dewey's belief:

[T]hat knowledge of social conditions, of the present state of civilization, is necessary in order properly to interpret the child's powers. The child has his own instincts and tendencies, but we do not know what these mean until we can translate them into their social equivalents. We must be able to carry them back into a social past and see them as the inheritance of previous race activities. We must also be able to project them into the future to see what their outcome and end will be. (Dewey 230)

Harry's firsthand knowledge of the social conditions enables him to direct the members of Dumbledore's Army in a manner that incorporates spells that will be useful for them if they ever encounter the Dark Arts; Harry is also able to exercise his ability to interpret the value of his past experience in relation to his lessons and notice the strengths and weaknesses of his students.

Harry continues his first lesson and recognizes his movement from student to teacher: “It felt very odd to be issuing instructions, but not nearly as odd as seeing them followed. Everybody got to their feet at once and divided up” (*Order of the Phoenix* 392-93). During the first lesson Harry partners with Neville, illustrating his ability (like Lupin’s) to encourage problematic students and simultaneously observe the actions of the other students:

The room was suddenly full of shouts of “*Expelliarmus!*”: Wands flew in all directions, missed spells hit books on shelves and sent them flying into the air. Harry was too quick for Neville, whose wand went spinning out of his hand, hit the ceiling in a shower of sparks, and landed with a clatter on top of a bookshelf, from which Harry retrieved it with a Summoning Charm. Glancing around he thought he had been right to suggest that they practice the basics first; there was a lot of shoddy spellwork going on; many people were not succeeding in disarming their opponents at all, but merely causing them to jump backward a few paces or wince as the feeble spell whooshed over them. (393)

Harry’s observation of his students allows him to judge their performance; Dewey discusses this as a necessary quality of teachers:

[I]t is his business to be on the alert to see what attitudes and habitual tendencies are being created. In this direction he must, if he is an educator, be able to judge what attitudes are actually conducive to continued growth and what are detrimental. He must, in addition, have that sympathetic understanding of individuals as individuals which gives him an idea of what is actually going on in the minds of those who are leaning. It is, among other things, the need for these abilities on the part of the parent and teacher which makes a system of education based upon living experience a more difficult affair to conduct successfully than it is to follow the patterns of traditional education. (Dewey 337)

Harry notices the actions of the other students and begins to measure their capabilities during the first lesson in order to understand what direction to move in future lessons.

Harry notices that a number of students are still having trouble with the basics; thus their mediocre practical application of theory motivates Harry to begin with simple practical

lessons and work up to more difficult ones. Harry corrects each student when he or she has trouble performing spells throughout his lessons. During the first meeting:

Harry walked around the other pairs, trying to correct those who were doing the spell wrong. Ginny was teamed with Michael Corner, she was doing very well, whereas Michael was either very bad or unwilling to jinx her. Ernie Macmillan was flourishing his wand unnecessarily, giving his partner time to get in under his guard; the Creevey brothers were enthusiastic but erratic and responsible for all the books leaping off the shelves around them. Luna Lovegood was similarly patchy, occasionally sending Justin Finch-Fletchley's wand spinning out of his hand, and other times merely causing his hair to stand on end. (*Order of the Phoenix* 394)

Harry understands that “[e]very experience is a moving force. Its value can be judged only on the ground of what it moves toward into... It is the business of the educator to see in what direction an experience is heading” (Dewey 336). Harry continues to observe his later lessons and give direction in the same manner:

“We can practice in pairs,” said Harry. “We’ll start with the Impediment Jinx, just for ten minutes, then we can get out the cushions and try Stunning again.”

They all divided up obediently; Harry partnered with Neville as usual. The room was soon full of intermitted cries of “*Impedimenta!*” People froze for a minute or so, during which their partners would stare aimlessly around the room watching other pairs at work, then would unfreeze and take their turn at the jinx.

Neville had improved beyond all recognition. After a while, when Harry had unfrozen three times in a row, he had Neville join Ron and Hermione again so that he could walk around the room and watch the others. When he saw Cho she beamed at him; he resisted the temptation to walk past her several more times.

After ten minutes on the Impediment Jinx, they laid out cushions all over the floor and started practicing Stunning again. Space was really too confined to allow them all to work this spell at once; half the group observed the others for a while, then swapped over. Harry felt himself positively swelling with pride as he watched them all. True, Neville did Stun Padma Patil rather than Dean, at whom he had been aiming, but it was a much closer miss than usual, and everybody else had made enormous progress. (*Order of the Phoenix* 454)

Harry's teaching routine resembles the pattern process that Lupin uses in his classroom: divide into pairs, practice, bring the group together, observe and practice. Dewey propounds that progressive organization of subject matter involves two steps; the teacher must link together the subject matter and the students' experience and the materials used to teach must be developed in an organized manner and presented in an interactive way. Harry is very aware of the importance of observation, interaction and practice and uses the space in the Room of Requirement to his advantage. Harry is also conscious of the time the students have spent preparing and practicing the spells and how proud he is:

Harry felt as though he were carrying some kind of talisman inside his chest over the following two weeks, a glowing secret that supported him through Umbridge's classes and made it possible for him to smile blandly as he looked into her horrible bulging eyes. He and the D.A. were resisting her under her very nose, doing the very thing that she and the Ministry most feared, and whenever he was supposed to be reading Wilbert Slinkhard's books during her lessons he dwelled instead on satisfying memories of their most recent meetings, remembering how Neville had successfully disarmed Hermione, how Colin Creevey had mastered the Impediment Jinx after three meetings' hard effort, how Parvati Patil had produced such a good Reductor Curse that she had reduced the table carrying all the Sneakoscopes to dust. (397)

Harry's utilization of space illustrates Dewey's claim that

[a] primary responsibility of educators is that they not only be aware for the general principle of the shaping of actual experience by environing conditions, but that they also recognize in the concrete what surroundings are conducive to having experiences that lead to growth. Above all, they should know how to utilize the surroundings, physical and social, that exist so as to extract from them all that they have to contribute to building up experience that are worthwhile. (Dewey 337-8)

Harry's use of space and time allows the students to develop and continue growing both intellectual and kinesthetically.

Harry's pride shows his ability to recognize his students' strengths and habits; Dewey defines habit as "the formation of attitudes, attitudes that are emotional and intellectual; it covers our basic sensitivities and ways of meeting and responding to all the conditions which we meet in living. From this point of view, the principle of continuity of experience means that every experience both takes up something from those which have gone before and modifies in some way the quality of those which come after" (Dewey 335). Harry facilitates a structured environment that allows the members of Dumbledore's Army to have a "continuous experience" that helps them improve upon the basic spells and build strength and concentration for mastering more difficult countercurses and spells.

Before their holiday break, Harry decides not to start "anything new right before a three-week break" because he feels the last meeting should be a review of what they have practiced over the semester. He motivates the students during the lesson and concludes with exciting news that they will begin conjuring Patronuses the next semester, enlisting interest and motivation in the members of Dumbledore's Army. When the students return from break, Harry notices a newfound determination in Neville:

Harry was pleased to see that all of them, even Zacharias Smith, had been spurred to work harder than ever by the news that ten more Death Eaters were now on the loose, but in nobody was this improvement more pronounced than Neville. The news of his parents' attacker's escape had wrought a strange and even slightly alarming change in him. He had not once mentioned his meeting with Harry, Ron, and Hermione on the closed ward in St. Mungo's, and taking their lead from him, they had kept quiet about it too. Nor had he said anything on the subject of Bellatrix and her fellow torturers' escape; in fact, he barely spoke during D.A. meetings anymore, but worked relentlessly on every new jinx and countercurse Harry taught them, his plump face screwed up in concentration, apparently indifferent to injuries or accidents, working harder than anyone else in the room. He was improving so fast it was quite unnerving and when Harry taught them the Shield Charm, a means of deflecting minor jinxes so that they rebounded upon the

attacker, only Hermione mastered the charm faster than Neville. (*Order of the Phoenix* 553)

This type of attitude is one that Dewey would recognize as a formation of purpose.

According to Dewey a student's discovery of purpose involves three steps:

(1) observation of surrounding conditions

(2) knowledge of what has happened in similar situations in the past, knowledge obtained partly by recollection and partly from the information, advice, and warning of those who have had a wider experience

(3) judgment which puts together what is observed and what is recalled to see what they signify. A purpose differs from an original impulse and desire through its translation into a plan and method of action based upon foresight of the consequences of acting under given observed condition in a certain way. (Dewey 351-352)

Harry recognizes Neville's discovery of purpose. He notices the surrounding conditions; the escape of the Death Eaters, including Bellatrix Lestrange who drove Neville's parents insane. Harry possesses the knowledge of what has happened in similar situations because he has experienced the return of the person who is responsible for his parents' deaths and knows that Neville has "the information, advice, and warning of those who have a wider experience," namely Harry and his professors at Hogwarts. Finally, Neville has begun to connect the necessary dots of theory and application causing his improvement to be monumental.

The final lesson Harry is able to give before Umbridge discovers the meeting place of Dumbledore's Army involves the students practicing their Patronus Charm. Harry again relates his experience to their studies: "They had finally started working on Patronuses, which everybody had been very keen to practice, though as Harry kept reminding them, producing a Patronus in the middle of a brightly lit classroom when they

were not under threat was very different to producing it when confronted by something like a dementor” (*Order of the Phoenix* 606). Harry thinks of ways to improve this lesson and relates it to Lupin’s instruction: “What we really need is a boggart or something; that’s how I learned, I had to conjure a Patronus while the boggart was pretending to be a dementor” (606). Harry’s emphasis upon the difference in conjuring a Patronus under terrifying settings recognizes that “[e]xperience does not go on simply inside a person...Every genuine experience has an active side which changes in some degree the objective conditions under which experiences are had” (Dewey 337). Dewey asserts this as a necessary component to learning through experience; the interaction of past and present, intellectual and physical, and growth through the continuity of practice and experience. Many of the students are only able to produce silver vapors out of their wand, but both Cho and Hermione have both successfully conjured their Patronus before the meeting is interrupted. Harry offers advice to those who are having trouble, reminding Neville he has “got to think of something happy” (606). Harry’s instruction during this lesson illustrates his ability as a teacher to organize a lesson that is “flexible enough to permit free play for individuality of experience and yet firm enough to give direction towards continuous development of power” (Dewey 347). Harry’s direction of this lesson enables the members to practice their Patronus freely and gives them the power to direct their Patronus once it is successfully conjured and the opportunity to concentrate and continue practicing if they are unsuccessful. Harry’s transition from student to teacher allows him to conduct his class in a similar way to the professor he has learned the most from—Remus Lupin. Lupin’s progressive pedagogy opposes the traditional method that

Umbridge implements and Harry despises. Dewey discusses the division between traditional and progressive education:

This fundamental opposition of the child and curriculum set up by these two modes of doctrine can be duplicated in a series of other terms. "Discipline" is the watchword of those who magnify the course of study; "interest" that of those who blazon "The Child" upon their banner. The standpoint of the former is logical; that of the latter psychological. The first emphasizes the necessity of adequate training and scholarship on the part of the teacher; the latter that of need and sympathy with the child, and knowledge of his natural instincts. "Guidance and control" are catchwords of one school; "freedom and initiative" of the other. Law is asserted here; spontaneity proclaimed there. The old, the conservation of what has been achieved in the pain and toil of the ages is dear to the one; the new change, progress, wins the affection of the other. Inertness and routine, chaos and anarchism, are accusations bandied back and forth. Neglect of the sacred authority of duty is charged by one side, only to be met by counter-charges of suppression of individuality through tyrannical despotism (Dewey 278-79)

Harry recognizes the power of progressive education and the importance of careful lesson planning. As the leader of Dumbledore's Army, Harry implements Lupin's pedagogy, offering a structured classroom that progresses logically and is centered around practical, experiential lessons. Harry also incorporates his personal experience, like Lupin, in order to provide his students with valuable information and examples of how to use the spells when encountering the Dark Arts. Harry situates his classroom in the same way that Lockhart and Snape arranged the Dueling Club, dividing the students into pairs and allowing them to practice spells on one another. Harry rejects Umbridge's textbook method by using books as items to practice spells on, not to copy notes from in class. His incorporation and discussion of his personal battles with Voldemort undermines Umbridge's method of punishment that assumes Harry's experiences are nasty little lies.

Overall, Harry's method supports Dewey's belief that experience is an essential part of education².

² Although I focus solely on Harry throughout this study, I do plan to extend this theory and discuss the nature of collaborative learning at Hogwarts in relation to Harry, Hermione and Ron, as well as the other extracurricular activities that take place at Hogwarts

CHAPTER VIII

CONCLUSION

“Just what is the role of the teacher and of books in promoting the educational development of the immature?” John Dewey in *Experience and Education*

Throughout the Harry Potter Series, the educators at Hogwarts illustrate the tension Dewey discusses between traditional and progressive education. Traditional education is teacher-centered, lecture and textbook based, static, didactic, systematic, and causes the students to become passive while progressive education is child-centered, activity-based, adaptable, inferential, facilitates experiential and metacognitive discovery learning, and enables the students to become active agents. So, why is it important to examine Dewey’s discussion of traditional and progressive pedagogies in relation to fictional teachers in a children’s series? It is important to examine these pedagogies in order to understand what the child reader understands as a positive educational experience. Rowling’s series presents close relationships between students and teachers and promotes interconnectedness between the adult and child world; Dewey would emphasize this as a strength of Hogwarts. Throughout the series, Rowling advocates for progressive education and condemns traditional methods of teaching in allowing Harry and the other students at Hogwarts to express their fascination with and dislike for the professors. Umbridge serves as Rowling’s commentary on the negative effects of traditional education and placing an academy in the wrong hands. Examining Umbridge’s

failure as a teacher in relation to the other Defense of the Dark Arts teachers illustrates Rowling's distaste for government enforced and traditional, lecture-based instruction.

Rowling uses the boarding school setting to illustrate necessitation of students forming close relationships with professors. This setting makes it easier for the students to discover and express themselves because they are removed from their families and placed in a setting different from their home. Hogwarts provides the students with new experiences that advocate progressive education such as: trips to town; practicing spells in class; including performance based tests, rather than the written form only; extracurricular activities and an institution where students are placed in a segregated setting and must learn to come together as they develop. Aside from the setting of Hogwarts, the professors serve as commentary about the traditional and progressive teaching philosophies Dewey discusses.

In this paper, I have compared the most progressive Defense Against the Dark Arts teacher to the most traditional and have critiqued the principles that make this distinction possible. In a further study of this same subject, it would be interesting to do an examination of Dumbledore as an advocate of progressive education. Focusing on Harry and Dumbledore's relationship, as well as his relationship with other central teachers—specifically Hagrid, Sprout, Snape, McGonagall, Trelawney—would further show Dewey's progressive philosophy in action at Hogwarts. It would also be interesting to examine the "rule breaking" aspect of the series and the lack of conflict between authoritative figures and Harry's disobedient actions. Often Harry is rewarded for placing himself and others in danger and in many of Dewey's essays he discusses the importance of danger in an academic setting. Finally, there is still much to be explored in relation to

how Harry's progression from student to educator to illustrate the importance of experience in education. Overall, Rowling uses Harry as an example of the ideal student—a student that is able to psychologize the material and become familiar enough with it to make the transition from student to teacher. The best teachers at Hogwarts, including Harry, promote peer interaction, practical lessons and collaborative learning in their classrooms, which shows that Rowling is an advocate of Dewey's experiential education philosophy. Overall, the Harry Potter series serves as a critique of educational practices and pedagogies that concur with Dewey's progressive pedagogy.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Adney, Karley Kristine. "From Books to Battle: Hermione's Quest for Knowledge in Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix." *Topic: The Washington and Jefferson College Review* 54 (Fall 2004): 103-112. MLA. Web. 22 March 2009.
- Attebery, Brian. *Strategies of Fantasy*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana UP, 1992. Print.
- Booth, Margaret Zoller and Grace Marie Booth. "What American Schools Can Learn from Hogwarts School Of Witchcraft and Wizardry." *Phi Delta Kappan* 85 (2003): 310-315. MLA. Web. 22 March 2009.
- Dewey, John. "The Child and the Curriculum." *Classic and Contemporary Readings in the Philosophy of Education*. Ed. Steven M. Cahn. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill Higher Education, 1997. 276-288. Print.
- . "Democracy and Education." *Classic and Contemporary Readings in the Philosophy of Education*. Ed. Steven M. Cahn. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill Higher Education, 1997. 288-325. Print.
- . "Experience and Education." *Classic and Contemporary Readings in the Philosophy of Education*. Ed. Steven M. Cahn. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill Higher Education, 1997. 325-363. Print.
- . "My Pedagogic Creed." *The Essential Dewey Volume 1: Pragmatism, Education, Democracy*. Ed. Larry A. Hickman and Thomas Alexander. Bloomington, IN: Indiana UP, 1998. 229-235. Print.
- Debling, Heather. "'You Survived to Bear Witness': Trauma, Testimony, and the Burden of Witnessing in Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix." *Topic: The Washington and Jefferson College Review* 54 (Fall 2004): 73-82. MLA. Web. 22 March 2009.
- Eagleton, Mary. "The Danger of Intellectual Masters: Lessons from Harry Potter and Antonia Byatt." *Revista Canaria de Estudios Ingleses* 48 (2004): 61-75. MLA. Web. 22 March 2009.
- Eccleshare Julia. *A Guide to the Harry Potter Novels*. New York, NY: Continuum, 2002. Print.
- Flaherty, Jennifer. "Harry Potter and the Freedom of Information: Knowledge and Control in Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix." *Topic: The Washington*

- and *Jefferson College Review* 54 (Fall 2004): 93-102. MLA. Web. 22 March 2009.
- Freire, Paulo. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. Trans. Myra Ramos. New York, NY: Continuum, 2000. Print.
- Heilman, Elizabeth E. *Harry Potter's World: Multidisciplinary Critical Perspectives*. New York, NY: Routledge-Falmer, 2003. Print.
- Hickman, Larry and Thomas Alexander. *The Essential Dewey*. Bloomington: IN: Indiana UP. 1998. Print.
- Pennington, John. "From Elfland to Hogwarts, or the Aesthetic Trouble with Harry Potter." *The Lion and The Unicorn* 26 (2002): 78-97. MLA. Web. 22 March 2009.
- Petrina, Alessandra. "Forbidden Forest, Enchanted Castle: Arthurian Space in the Harry Potter Novels." *Mythlore* 93/94 (2006): 95-110. Project Muse. Web. 2 March 2009.
- Rowling, J.K. *Harry Potter and the Chamber of Secrets*. New York: Scholastic Press, 1999. Print.
- *Harry Potter and the Deathly Hallows*. New York: Scholastic Press, 2007. Print.
- *Harry Potter and the Goblet of Fire*. New York: Scholastic Press, 2000. Print.
- *Harry Potter and the Half-Blood Prince*. New York: Scholastic Press, 2005. Print.
- *Harry Potter and the Order of the Phoenix*. New York: Scholastic Press, 2003. Print.
- *Harry Potter and the Prisoner of Azkaban*. New York: Scholastic Press, 1999. Print.
- *Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone*. New York: Scholastic Press, 1997. Print.
- Whited, Lana A. *The Ivory Tower and Harry Potter: Perspectives on a Literary Phenomenon* Columbia, MO: U of Missouri P, 2002. Print.
- Zipes, Jack. *Sticks and Stones: The Troublesome Success of Children's Literature from Slovenly Peter to Harry Potter*. New York: Routledge, 2001. Print.

VITA

Kandace Leigh Lytle was born in Sugar Land, Texas, on July 20, 1985. After completing her work at I.H. Kempner High School, Sugar Land, Texas in 2003, she entered Southwestern University in Georgetown, Texas. There she received a Bachelor of Arts in both English and Philosophy and minored in Dance in May of 2007. In August of 2007, she enrolled at Texas State University-San Marcos to earn a Master of Arts in English with a Minor in Philosophy and served as an Instructional Assistant for the Philosophy Department until graduation.

Permanent Address: 2410 Parrott Shell Lane
Richmond, TX 77406

This thesis was typed by Kandace Lytle.